1 2

Title: Hierarchical Assembly and Environmental Enhancement of Bacterial Ice Nucleators

- 3
- 4 Authors: Galit Renzer^{a,1}, Ingrid de Almeida Ribeiro^{b,1}, Hao-Bo Guo^c, Janine Fröhlich-
- 5 Nowoisky^d, Rajiv J. Berry^c, Mischa Bonn^a, Valeria Molinero^{b,2}, and Konrad Meister^{a,e,2}

6 Affiliations:

- 7 ^aMax Planck Institute for Polymer Research, 55128 Mainz, Germany
- 8 ^bDepartment of Chemistry, The University of Utah, 84112-0850 Salt Lake City, UT, USA
- 9 ^cAir Force Research Laboratory, Wright-Patterson Air Force Base, Dayton, OH, 45433, USA
- 10 ^dMax Planck Institute for Chemistry, 55128 Mainz, Germany
- ¹¹ ^eDepartment of Chemistry and Biochemistry, Boise State University, 83725 Boise, ID, USA
- 12 ¹G.R. and I.d.A.R. contributed equally to this work
- ²To whom correspondence may be addressed. Email: <u>valeria.molinero@utah.edu</u> or
 <u>meisterk@mpip-mainz.mpg.de</u>.
- 15
- 16
- 17 Classification: Physical Sciences; Biophysics and Computational Biology
- 18 Keywords: Ice-nucleating proteins, protein assembly, bacteria, heterogeneous ice nucleation
- 19
- 20

21 Abstract:

22 Bacterial ice nucleating proteins (INPs) are exceptionally effective in promoting the kinetically 23 hindered transition of water to ice. Their efficiency relies on the assembly of INPs into large 24 functional aggregates, with the size of ice nucleation sites determining activity. Experimental 25 freezing spectra have revealed two distinct, defined aggregate sizes, typically classified as class A and C ice nucleators (INs). Despite the importance of INPs and years of extensive research, 26 27 the precise number of INPs forming the two aggregate classes and their assembly mechanism 28 have remained enigmatic. Here, we report that bacterial ice nucleation activity emerges from 29 more than two prevailing aggregate species and identify the specific number of INPs 30 responsible for distinct crystallization temperatures. We find that INP dimers constitute class 31 C INs, tetramers class B INs, and hexamers and larger multimers are responsible for the most 32 efficient class A activity. We propose a hierarchical assembly mechanism based on tyrosine interactions for dimers, and electrostatic interactions between INP dimers to produce larger 33 34 aggregates. This assembly is membrane-assisted: increasing the bacterial outer membrane 35 fluidity decreases the population of the larger aggregates, while preserving the dimers. 36 Inversely, DPBS buffer increases the population of multimeric class A and B aggregates 200fold and endows the bacteria with enhanced stability towards repeated freeze-thaw cycles. Our 37 38 analysis suggests that the enhancement results from the better alignment of dimers in the 39 negatively charged outer membrane, due to screening of their electrostatic repulsion. This 40 constitutes the first demonstration of enhancement of the most potent bacterial INs.

41

42 Significance:

43 Fifty years ago, bacteria were identified as remarkable ice nucleators that enable water freezing 44 close to 0 °C. Their record-holding activity is key for frost damage to crops and snow making. 45 While it is known that bacterial freezing relies on the assembly of INPs, details of the 46 underlying assembly mechanism and structures remained elusive. Here, we elucidate the size 47 of the INP multimers responsible for superior ice nucleation and their formation process. We unravel a hierarchical assembly mechanism that explains the distinct ice nucleation 48 49 temperatures of bacteria and their sensitivity to environmental factors. We demonstrate 50 enhancement of the ice nucleation potency of the bacteria by controlling the pH and ionic 51 content, expanding their potential use in freezing applications.

53 Main Text

54

55 Introduction:

56 Bacterial ice nucleators (INs) are highly efficient in initiating ice crystallization at high sub-57 zero temperatures. Their remarkable control of the crystallization process is based on 58 specialized ice-nucleating proteins (INPs) that are anchored to the outer membrane of the 59 bacterial cell wall and are proposed to form large functional aggregates (1-3). The most 60 extensively studied bacterial INs are Pseudomonas syringae, which enable ice formation at 61 temperatures up to -2°C (4, 5). As plant pathogens, they use their freezing capabilities to 62 provoke frost injuries to plant tissues, allowing them to access the plant's nutrients (6). 63 Together with their widespread distribution (7-9), this makes P. syringae a significant 64 contributor to frost damage in the biosphere, causing agricultural losses through crop 65 devastation (10). Bacterial INs have further been detected in rain, hail, and snow, pointing to a 66 role in atmospheric freezing processes, influencing the hydrological cycle and the overall 67 balance of Earth's climate (11–14). Due to their superior freezing efficiency, bacterial INs are 68 widely used for artificial snowmaking and are raising attention for potential use in 69 cryopreservation, anti-icing surfaces, and novel freezing technologies (15-18). Despite their 70 importance and the extensive research over the past years (1, 3, 19–26), several questions 71 remain unanswered regarding their mode of action and the possibility of enhancing their ice 72 nucleation efficiency and resistance to freeze-thawing cycles. These are the questions we 73 address in the present study.

74 The principal modus operandi of INPs is to provide a surface that strongly binds to ice, thus 75 decreasing the free energy barrier for ice nucleation (2). The strong binding is supported by the 76 ordering of water at the ice-binding surfaces of the INP (19, 20, 27, 28). The general structure 77 of bacterial INPs is subdivided into three domains (27), with the central repeating domain 78 (CRD) comprising the majority of the structure. The CRD contains the active site and is formed 79 by a variable number of tandem repeats of a highly conserved 16-residue sequence (19). The N-terminal domain is involved in anchoring the protein to the membrane, and the C-terminal 80 81 domain is proposed to have a capping function to stabilize the protein structure (21). However, 82 the structural characterization of INPs, remains challenging due to their large size (~ 130 kDa) 83 and localization in the outer membrane (OM). Several theoretical studies predicted β -solenoid 84 folds for the CRD of INPs, where the active site consists of long arrays of TxT motifs located on one side and SLT motifs located on the opposite side of the flat solenoid structure (21–24,
29).

87 While an INP structure provides water-organizing motifs of high repetitiveness, the ice-binding 88 area of monomeric INPs is insufficient to achieve high ice nucleation efficiencies. To 89 accomplish freezing close to 0°C, bacterial INs critically depend on their ability to form large 90 INP multimers (2, 25, 30, 31). A distribution of sizes of ice nucleation sites is further required 91 to explain the typically broad freezing range from -2 to -12°C. Freezing assays revealed that 92 bacterial INs are active in particular temperature regions, which led to the categorization of INs 93 into three distinct classes (32). Class A comprises the most efficient INs active at temperatures 94 above -4.4°C, class B IN are active between -4.4 and -7.6°C, and class C IN active below -95 7.6°C (32). Although there is agreement that Class C INs correspond to small INPs aggregates, 96 and class A INs to larger INP assemblies, little is known about the definite size and numbers 97 of INPs involved in these multimers and their assembly mechanism (3, 24, 25). Simulations 98 and nucleation theory have addressed the size and assembly pattern of aggregated INPs (2). 99 However, quantitative predictions are highly sensitive to the actual dimension of the protein 100 binding surface, distance between monomers, alignment between the INPs, as well as strength 101 of protein-ice interactions (2). Furthermore, an intact bacterial membrane has been shown to 102 be required for functional aggregation of INPs (33-35). Removal of the membrane abolishes 103 class A IN activity, and the addition of membrane lipids fails to restore it (33). Membrane 104 fluidity disrupting agents have been shown to decrease class A activity (4, 34), indicating that 105 the membrane is not only a matrix for INP assembly but also has a decisive role in functional 106 aggregation.

107 Here we combine ice nucleation and membrane fluidity experiments, numerical modelling, AI-108 based protein structure prediction, and nucleation theory to elucidate the number of proteins in 109 the IN of *P. syringae*, propose a hierarchical mechanism for their assembly, confirm the key 110 role of the outer membranes in the stability of larger aggregates, and demonstrate that the right 111 combination of pH and ions in the ice nucleating solution preserves the large INs against 112 disassembly in freeze-thawing cycles and -most surprisingly- promotes their assembly. Using 113 these insights, we make Snomax® as potent an ice nucleation agent as the as the most potent 114 strains of live P. syringae.

- 115
- 116

117 **Results and Discussion:**

118

119 Freeze-thaw cycles result in the disassembly of large INP aggregates into smaller ones.

Fig. 1A shows the cumulative freezing spectra of bacteria from the strain Pseudomonas 120 121 syringae Cit7, subjected to consecutive freeze-thaw cycles. The initial freezing spectrum of a 122 ten-fold dilution series of alive *P. syringae* in water with an initial concentration of 0.1 mg/mL 123 displays a wide range of freezing temperatures with maximum ice nucleation activity up to -124 2°C. The freezing spectrum shows a strong increase in the cumulative IN concentration $N_{\rm m}(T)$ per unit mass of bacteria at -2.4°C and a second increase at -7.5°C, with plateaus between -5°C 125 126 and -7°C and below -9°C. The two steep increases in the freezing spectrum indicate that the 127 activity of *P. syringae* originates from IN species with different nucleation efficiencies. In 128 contrast, plateaus indicate few active INs at these temperature ranges. Based on their nucleation 129 temperatures, we assign the IN species to class A (-2.4°C) and C (-7.5°C) INs. We did not observe class B INs in the cumulative freezing spectra, in agreement with previous studies (3, 130 131 30, 33, 36–38).



132

Fig. 1. Freezing experiments of aqueous samples containing bacterial INs from *P. syringae* after repetitive freeze-thaw cycles. (A) Cumulative number of INs per unit mass of *P. syringae* (N_m). The cyan line represents the optimized solution obtained through the HUB method, assuming that the differential spectrum is a linear combination of three Gaussian subpopulations. (B) Normalized distribution function that represents the corresponding differential freezing spectra $n_m(T)$.

The ice nucleation activity shows a consistent trend when the bacteria undergo repetitive freeze-thaw cycles. Class A INs exhibit progressive degradation, leading to a lower cumulative concentration, as well as a shift to lower temperatures. In contrast, $N_m(T)$ of class C INs increases throughout the cycles. Since freeze-thaw cycles do not cause chemical changes in the INP aggregate structures, this alteration in the ice nucleation activity must originate from physical effects. These observations align with previous findings which showed that bacterial
INs with high freezing efficiencies are unstable towards changing environmental conditions,
whereas IN active at lower temperatures remain stable (30, 32, 36).

147 To systematically investigate the changes in the freezing spectra for every cycle, we analyzed the underlying distribution of heterogeneous ice nucleation temperatures. The differential 148 149 freezing spectra are derived from the cumulative spectra by using the Heterogeneous 150 Underlying-Based (HUB) method (39). This analysis implements a stochastic optimization 151 procedure that fits the experimentally obtained cumulative spectra with a linear combination 152 of Gaussian subpopulations. The resulting computed differential spectra that reproduce the 153 distribution of ice nucleation temperatures allow for a characterization of the underlying IN 154 classes.

155 We find that fitting the spectra with a combination of two subpopulations based on the 156 assignment of two distinct IN classes does not match the initial freezing spectrum of P. 157 syringae and exhibits a discrepancy between -3.8 and -7.3°C and a mean squared error (MSE) 158 of 0.53% (for details see Fig. S1). A more accurate solution is achieved by considering three 159 subpopulations, which lowers MSE to 0.1%, a factor of five improvement for 1.5 times the 160 number of fit parameters. The resulting differential spectrum reveals that 49% of the IN 161 nucleate ice at -8.6 \pm 1.5°C, 39% are active at -4.3 \pm 0.5°C, and 12% are active at -3.1 \pm 0.2°C. 162 We assign the subpopulation active at -8.6°C to class C. The other subpopulations are assigned 163 to class A INs, since both modes fall into the class A regime (32). This implies that the ice 164 nucleation activity of P. syringae relies on more than two IN populations and that class A 165 consists of more than one aggregate species.

166 The HUB analysis also reveals that class C INs increase from 49% to 99.6% within ten freeze-167 thaw cycles, while the class A subpopulations decline over hundred-fold, from 39% to 0.3% and from 12% to less than 0.1%. Throughout these changes in the IN populations, the total 168 169 cumulative concentration of INs per mass unit remains constant, highlighting that no INs are 170 lost. These results prove that class A INs are not destroyed, but rather transformed into class C 171 INs through repetitive freezing. Moreover, we observe an additional temperature shift for both 172 class A subpopulations to lower temperatures. The IN subpopulation active at -4.3°C changes 173 to -5.3°C, shifting from class A into class B regime. The HUB analysis shows that class C INs 174 are the most stable IN population, since their fraction does not decrease over time and the total 175 IN number remains constant. Although class B INs are not in the original cumulative freezing 176 spectra, the distribution analysis confirms its presence after several freeze-thaw cycles. We

177 conclude that the higher-ordered class A INP aggregates are destabilized during repetitive

freezing and disassemble into smaller INP aggregates with lower ice nucleation temperatures.

- 178
- 179

180 Class C are INP dimers, B are tetramers, and A are hexamers and larger aggregates.

181 To determine the number $N_{\rm INP}$ of INPs required for the formation of aggregates promoting ice 182 formation at the observed freezing temperatures, we utilize the HINT algorithm (2). HINT 183 predicts heterogeneous ice nucleation temperatures of surfaces of finite size using classical 184 nucleation theory parameterized with experimental data for water (2). We assume for the HINT 185 calculation that the ice-binding surface is flat and the distance between monomers remains 186 constant. The inset of Fig. 2A shows the predicted AlphaFold structure of the INP of P. 187 syringae (40). The protein fold is predicted with high confidence level (Fig. S2) and reveals a 188 length of ~ 30 nm and a maximum width d of the CRD about 3.4 nm. Previous simulations showed that increasing the length of the water-organizing β -helix of INPs does not have a 189 190 significant effect on the corresponding ice nucleation temperature, whereas expanding the 191 width of the system by parallel alignment of INPs results in enhanced efficiency (2). Figure 2A 192 shows the predicted ice nucleation temperatures of the side-by-side INP aggregates, together 193 with the ranges for class A, B and C.





195 Fig. 2. Quantification of INPs for aggregates responsible for the observed distinct IN 196 subpopulations. (A) Ice nucleation temperatures as a function of the number of INPs $N_{\rm INP}$ from 197 P. syringae predicted by classical nucleation theory (CNT) implemented in the HINT 198 algorithm. Black squares show the freezing temperatures of rectangular surfaces derived from 199 parallel aligned INP monomers considering a monomer width of 3.4 nm (structure of monomer 200 predicted by Alphafold is shown as inset). The freezing temperature of ice increases with the 201 number of protein monomers in the INP aggregates. The blue shadowed regions indicate the typical temperature ranges of class A, B and C. (B) Normalized distribution function of 202 bacterial samples representing the corresponding differential freezing spectrum $n_{\rm m}$ (T). Vertical 203

204 lines are based on the HINT predictions and indicate the freezing temperatures of different 205 aggregates. The number in squared brackets describes the N_{INP} of the aggregate.

206

207 Fig. 2B presents an overlay of the distribution of populations of IN in *P. syringae* on the 1st and 10^{th} freeze-thaw-cycle, together with the predicted ice nucleation temperatures T_{het} as a 208 209 function of the number of side-by-side INPs at the ice-binding site. By comparing the results 210 of HINT with the distribution analysis of the freeze-thaw experiments, we obtain a correlation 211 between INP aggregate sizes and the corresponding temperature modes of the subpopulations. 212 We find no INP monomers or trimers in the bacteria: class C activity corresponds to the INP 213 dimer, confirming the assignment of previous studies (22, 24). The efficiency of such dimers 214 relies on the equal ice nucleation ability of the two-sides of the INP (23). Our analysis reveals 215 that a minimum of six INPs are required to reach the temperature range of class A INs.

216 We conclude that in the initial freezing spectrum of P. syringae the class C INs originate from 217 INP dimers, the class A INs with lower efficiency (-4.3°C) from hexamers, and the most 218 efficient class A INs (-3.1°C) from multimers containing at least 12 INPs. No significant 219 changes occur to the class C dimers upon freeze-thaw cycling, whereas the other 220 subpopulations change dramatically along these cycles. Figure 2B supports that the class A IN 221 subpopulation corresponding to hexamers disassembles to produce tetramers, which we assign 222 as class B INs, resulting in the disappearance of the larger multimeric aggregates of Class A 223 INs from the freezing spectrum.

To generalize our findings, we analyzed the widely used sample Snomax® (Fig. 2b, Fig. S3) (41, 42), which consists of inactivated bacteria from *P. syringae*. Similar to alive bacteria, the inactivated bacteria show class A and class C INs (see SI, Fig. S3), which we assign to INP multimers and the INP dimer, respectively. The distribution analysis of Snomax further confirms the existence of class B INs originating from INP tetramers.

229

Size of aggregates is consistent with a dimer-based assembly mechanism driven byelectrostatics.

The assignment of even-number INP aggregates (dimers, tetramers, octamers, etc.) defies previous expectations of a continuum of sizes. It elicits the question of what determines the proportion of INP aggregates and their assembly mechanism. 235 We interpret that the dimerization of INPs is due to the stacking of the highly conserved 236 tyrosine ladders (22), which create a surface where the ice-making motifs on the two sides of 237 the β -helix align to expand the width of the combined nucleation site, and that the assembly of 238 the larger aggregates is driven by electrostatic interactions. Fig. 3A shows the electrostatic 239 surface model of the INP, which we obtained using AlphaFold. The INP model shows a clear 240 pattern of charged residues. A large number of negative residues are located close to the N-241 terminal domain of the solenoid, whereas several positively charged residues are found close 242 to the C-terminal domain. In addition, the tail of the C-terminal domain also contains charged 243 residues. Our calculations with Alphafold version 2.3.2 (43) predict that the P. syringae INP 244 dimer and higher multimeric aggregates form twisted amyloid structures that bury the ice-245 nucleating protein surfaces from water (Fig. S4). Those structures are inconsistent with the 246 high ice nucleation temperatures of the bacteria.

247 We propose that INP dimers assemble into tetramers through electrostatic interactions by the 248 outward-facing positively and negatively charged residues found on opposing ends of the β-249 solenoids and opposite to the tyrosine ladder (Fig. 3B). The INP tetramer formation is assisted by the disordered charged tail of the C-terminal domain, which acts as a cap and provides 250 251 structural stability. The essential function of the C-terminal domain in the proposed dimer and tetramer assembly mechanism is in line with previous reports that showed that deletion of the 252 253 C-terminal domain eliminated all activity (21, 44, 45). Capping structures are further known to 254 be essential for the stability of β -solenoids, and in their absence the solenoids tend to unravel 255 or form amyloid fibrils (46).





257 Fig. 3. Assembly of INPs into functional aggregates (A) Electrostatic surface map of the INP 258 monomer. Positively charged residues (blue) are clustered on one site closer to the C-terminus, 259 whereas negatively charged residues (red) are found closer to the N-terminus. (B) INP 260 assembly mechanism into dimers, tetramers, hexamers, octamers, and higher-order multimers. 261 Dimer formation is mediated through the stacking of the solvent-exposed tyrosine ladders 262 (green areas) between adjacent monomers and is assisted by the C-terminal tail (yellow) which likely acts as a cap. The tetramer, hexamer, and octamer formation are mediated through 263 264 electrostatic interactions by outward-facing positively and negatively charged residues found 265 on opposing ends of the β -solenoids opposite to the tyrosine ladder. Octamers can be formed 266 by electrostatic interactions between a tetramer and two dimers or between two tetramer units.

267

268 The bacterial outer membrane is key for the assembly of dimers into larger aggregates.

269 Having established the size of the INP aggregates in the bacteria, we focus on the role of the 270 OM in the functional INP assembly. It has previously been shown that aggregation of class C 271 bacterial INPs can occur in solution (24), but the OM is needed to produce the most active INs. 272 To probe the role of the OM on the stability of bacterial INs, we measure ice nucleation by 273 Snomax as a function of treatment temperature, in the presence of membrane fluidizing agents, 274 at low pH, and in the absence and presence of ions. By focusing on inactivated bacteria, we 275 can exclude physiological factors such as protein synthesis, or homeoviscous adaptation, 276 enabling us to single out the physical impact of environmental changes and cosolutes on OM 277 fluidity and their impact on ice nucleation.

278 Fig. 4A shows the cumulative freezing spectra of Snomax as a function of changing 279 environmental conditions. We find that when Snomax is subjected to warm temperatures prior 280 to ice nucleation activity measurements, class A INs disintegrate, as evidenced in the freezing 281 spectra and the corresponding distribution functions (Fig. 4B). This effect becomes more 282 pronounced at higher temperatures, with class A and B INs completely disappearing when 283 Snomax is exposed to temperatures above 35°C (Fig. S5). Under such conditions, the freezing 284 activity is primarily due to the robust dimers of class C INs. Importantly, previous studies 285 showed that temperatures up to 35°C do not cause secondary structure changes in INPs (26, 286 45). This is in line with our observation that no loss of cumulative IN concentrations occurs up to 30°C and that $N_{\rm m}$ only decreases beyond 35°C. We conclude that elevated temperatures 287 288 impact the stability of the larger, more efficient INP aggregates, while leaving the INP dimers 289 intact.



290

Fig. 4. Freezing experiments of aqueous samples containing bacterial IN from Snomax after targeting the membrane fluidity through temperature, membrane fluidizing agents, the pH level, and ion removal through dialysis. (A) Cumulative number of INs per unit mass of Snomax. (B) Normalized distribution functions that represents the corresponding differential freezing spectra. (C) Generalized polarization values as a function of temperature of the membrane dye Laurdan incorporated into the membrane of Snomax. The fluorescence intensity was measured at emission wavelengths of 440 and 490 nm (see Fig. S5).

298

299 Membrane fluidity measurements show that the inherently rigid OM (47) become more fluid 300 upon heating (Fig. 4C, Fig. S6). This increase is associated with enhanced lateral mobility of 301 membrane components, enabling INPs to diffuse within the more fluid membrane, thus 302 facilitating the disassembly of larger INP aggregates. The finding that enhanced membrane 303 fluidity disintegrates class A INs is supported by our freezing spectra in the absence of ions, at low pH, and in the presence of 2-Phenylethanol (PhEtOH). All these conditions are known to 304 305 increase membrane fluidity (48), and induce similar changes to the distribution of bacterial IN 306 classes (Fig. 4A, B). In all spectra, only class C INs prevail, and the additional shift observed

e.g. for PhEtOH can be explained by the colligative melting point depression. The minimal
 temperature dependence of class C INs starkly contrasts with the environmental sensitivity of
 the larger INP aggregates into which they assemble.

310

311 DPBS buffer stabilizes and promotes the formation of large class A aggregates.

Having identified which parameters decrease class A IN activity, we now address whether it is 312 313 possible to stabilize and promote the formation of the large class A IN. Figure 5 shows freezing 314 spectra of Snomax in water, DPBS, and HEPES buffer at pH 7. Strikingly, we find a 315 tremendous enhancement of class A IN activity when measurements were performed in DPBS 316 buffer, which contains sodium and potassium chloride in addition to the Na₂HPO₄/KH₂PO₄ 317 buffer system. The combined fraction of class A and B increases 200-fold, from 0.1% in water 318 to 19.5% in DPBS. We further observed only a minimal shift towards lower temperatures, 319 despite an expected melting point depression caused by the buffer compounds. This 320 demonstrates that DPBS buffer efficiently promotes larger INP assemblies. Moreover, DBPS 321 endows the bacteria with enhanced stability towards repeated freeze-thaw cycles (Fig. S7).





Maintaining the pH level within a physiological range is critical for the stability of INP multimers (30), as moving to acidic pH levels and approaching the isoelectric point of the INPs prevents the formation of multimers, highlighting that electrostatic interactions between dimer

331 units play a pivotal role in functional INP aggregation. Yet, measurements in HEPES buffer 332 show that the optimal pH range alone is insufficient to enhance INP activity (Fig. 5). 333 Measurements in the presence of HEPES at the same pH as DPBS did not result in enhancement 334 (Fig. 5). DPBS contains cations absent in HEPES, suggesting that there are specific ion effects 335 influencing the stabilization of large INP aggregates. By systematically measuring Snomax in the presence of the different buffer components (Fig. S7B), we reveal that the presence of 336 337 sodium and potassium chloride with the Na₂KHPO₄/KH₂PO₄ buffer system in DPBS is 338 required to effectively stabilize INP multimers in Snomax. Experiments in NaCl confirm that 339 salt alone has no effect on the class A INs in aqueous solutions, while it shows a clear increase 340 in INP stabilization in the buffer (Fig. S7).

Fig S8 demonstrates that enhancement effects can be induced in buffers that were originally not showing enhancement through the addition of salts (e.g. adding NaCl to HEPES buffer). We interpret that the resultant concentration of monovalent cations screens the highly negatively charged lipopolysaccharides (LPS) in the OM, strengthening the interactions between the negatively charged proteins (48). We propose that the ion/buffer system limits electrostatic interactions between the predominantly negative LPS and INPs, stabilizes membrane integrity, and thus promotes interactions between INP dimers for aggregation.

348

349 Conclusions:

350 Our results and analyses provide a unifying, quantitative picture of the assembly mechanism 351 of bacterial ice nucleation and the properties of distinct IN classes. By combining results from 352 droplet freezing experiments with stochastic optimization procedures, we identify more than 353 the two commonly discussed class A and class C INs observed in the cumulative freezing 354 spectra of ice-active bacteria. Using the improved structural prediction by AlphaFold of the 355 width and length of the ice-binding site of the bacterial protein combined with nucleation 356 theory calculations of the heterogeneous ice nucleation temperature for finite-size surfaces, we 357 determine the distinct sizes of the different INP aggregates in the bacteria. We confirm that 358 INP dimers are the fundamental unit for aggregation for class C activity and unveil that Class 359 A INs consist of different multimers comprising at least INP hexamers. Our findings highlight 360 that class A IN activity is achieved by INP aggregates with sizes as small as ~ 720 kDa, about 361 25 times smaller than previously proposed sizes of ~19,000 kDa (25). We propose that the 362 formation of the multimers is based on electrostatic interactions between INP dimers, which

show a distinctive complementary pattern of outward-facing regions with high charge
densities. Our work further resolves the enigma of the originally proposed class B, whose
existence we now confirm and ascribe to INP tetramers.



366

Fig. 6. Proposed mechanism of functional INP aggregation in the bacterial OM. Environmental
 factors such as pH, cosolutes, or temperature can alter membrane fluidity and interprotein
 interactions, which results in the disassembly of the large functional INP aggregates necessary
 for ice nucleation activity at high sub-zero temperatures.

371

Our systematic alteration of experimental conditions (e.g. pH, temperature, cosolutes) provides conclusive evidence supporting a mechanism where the highest ice nucleation activity in bacteria originates from the formation of functional INP aggregates within the OM as schematically shown in Figure 6. This is further underlined by a recent study highlighting that class C INs are insensitive to extreme pH from 2 to 11 and heating when the membrane is absent (44). In contrast, minimal pH and temperature changes are sufficient to drastically decrease class A IN activity in the intact membrane (30).

Remarkably, we discover that bacterial ice nucleation can be enhanced by stabilizing INP and membrane-protein interactions through carefully balancing external factors (ions, pH, temperature). We demonstrate that the conditions that enhance the population of class A aggregates also protect the bacteria against loss of ice nucleation potency upon freeze-thaw cycles. We conjecture that the enhancement arises from the correct alignment of INPs within the aggregates upon screening of their negative charge. The sensitivity to environmental conditions is consistent with the predictions that even slight (Angstrom) variations of distances between INPs (e.g. due to environmental changes) destabilize the budding ice embryos on the protein surface, dramatically decreasing the ice nucleation temperature (2). Bacteria must exert exquisite control of the distance and alignment of the INP on its OM to freeze ice at temperatures as high as -2°C (2). Our findings in this work demonstrate that this control can be effectively exerted through environmental variables, broadening the range of uses of bacterial INPs for freezing applications and opening the question of whether these controls are used by the bacteria under physiological conditions.

393

394 Materials and Methods:

395

396 <u>Materials:</u>

397 Pure water was obtained from Millipore Milli-Q® Integral 3 water purification system (Merck 398 Chemicals GmbH, Darmstadt, Germany), autoclaved at 121°C for 15 min and filtered through 399 a 0.1 µm bottle top filtration unit (VWR International GmbH, Darmstadt, Germany). Snomax® 400 was purchased from SMI Snow Maker AG (Thun, Switzerland) and contains a preparation of 401 inactivated bacteria cells of P. syringae. Dulbecco's Phosphate-Buffered Saline (DPBS; 402 without CaCl₂ and MgCl₂), HEPES, MOPS, and Laurdan (6-Dodecanoyl-N,N-dimethyl-2-403 naphthylamine) were purchased from Sigma-Aldrich (Darmstadt, Germany). 2-404 Phenylethylalcohol was purchased from TCI (Tokyo, Japan). NaOH, NaCl, Na₂HPO₄ and 405 KH₂PO₄ were purchased from Carl Roth (Karlsruhe, Germany) and KCl from Serva 406 Electrophoresis GmbH (Heidelberg, Germany). The P. syringae CiT7 strain was provided by 407 Steven Lindow from the University of California, Berkeley.

408

409 <u>Sample Preparation:</u>

P. syringae CiT7 were grown on King B agar for 3 days at 21°C before assaying. The samples were prepared in pure water with a concentration of 0.1 mg/mL. Snomax samples were prepared in pure water, 0.1 M buffer, and various salt solutions with a concentration of 0.1 mg/mL. Commercial DPBS buffer (Sigma D1408, pH 7) was used as received. MOPS (pH 7) and HEPES buffer (pH 7) were prepared without adding salts and the pH values were adjusted by adding NaOH. Components of DPBS were measured by preparing a 9.57 mM Na₂HPO₄/KH₂PO₄ solution, a 0.14 M NaCl solution, a 2.68 mM KCl solutions, and combined

salt solutions of the same molarities. For dialysis measurements, Snomax samples were
dialyzed at 4°C against pure water for 24 hours, and for cosolutes measurements in the presence
of 50 mM 2-Phenylethanol.

420 <u>TINA measurements:</u>

421 Ice nucleation experiments were performed using the high-throughput Twin-plate Ice 422 Nucleation Assay (TINA), which has been described in detail elsewhere (49). In a typical 423 experiment, the investigated IN sample was serially diluted 10-fold by a liquid handling station 424 (epMotion ep5073, Eppendorf, Hamburg, Germany). 96 droplets (droplet volume: 3 µL) per 425 dilution were placed on two 384-well plates and tested with a continuous cooling-rate of 1 426 °C/min from 0 °C to -30 °C. The droplet freezing events were detected by two infrared cameras 427 (Seek Thermal Compact XR, Seek Thermal Inc., Santa Barbara, CA, USA). The uncertainty in 428 the temperature of the setup was ± 0.2 °C. The cumulative number of INs was inferred from the 429 obtained fraction of frozen droplets using the Vali formula (50). Experiments were performed 430 at least three times on independent samples. Background freezing of pure water in our system occurred at ~-21°C. 431

432 *Temperature-dependent Measurements:*

433 For freeze-thaw experiments of *P. syringae*, samples of a concentration of 0.1 mg/mL in pure 434 water were serially diluted 2-fold to create dilutions ranging from 0.1 mg/mL to 0.5 µg/mL. 435 After being cooled down to -30°C, the samples were allowed to thaw at room temperature 436 before the next measurement. 15 consecutive freeze-thaw cycles were performed. The same 437 procedure was carried out for freeze-thaw experiments of Snomax in pure water (0.1 mg/mL, 438 10-fold dilution series, 12 cycles) and in 0.1 M DBPS buffer solution (0.1 mg/mL, 10-fold 439 dilution series, 12 cycles). Snomax samples were prepared in pure water with a concentration of 0.1 mg/mL and heated to temperatures ranging from 20°C to 45°C for one hour prior to 440 441 measurement (0.1 mg/mL, 10-fold dilution series).

442

443 Identification of the Ice Nucleating Subpopulations through HUB Analysis:

The Heterogeneous Underlying-Based (HUB) method (39) was utilized for the identification and quantification of the subpopulations that constitute the experimental cumulative freezing spectra. This method uses a stochastic optimization technique to extract the underlying distribution of heterogeneous ice nucleation temperatures $P_{\mu}(T)$ that describes the characteristic 448 freezing temperatures of all INs in a sample. For this, the HUB-backward code available as a 449 Python code (https://github.com/Molinero-Group/underlying-distribution) was used to 450 compute the differential freezing spectra $n_{\rm m}(T)$, representing $P_{\rm u}(T)$, from the cumulative 451 freezing spectra $N_{\rm m}(T)$ obtained from TINA experiments. $P_{\rm u}(T)$ is assumed to be a linear 452 combination of normalized Gaussian distribution functions $P_i(T)$ that represents a distinct number of subpopulations p of the weights c_i that give $\sum_{i=1}^{p} c_i = 1$. Each subpopulation $P_i(T)$ 453 454 is further characterized by its characteristic freezing temperature mode $T_{mode,i}$ and the spread 455 of the temperature distribution s_i . The experimentally obtained $N_m(T)$ is interpolated through a 456 spline and smoothed with a Savitzky-Golay filter of first polynomial order with a default value 457 of 3 for the length of the filter window. For Snomax, data are interpolated with a number of 458 100 equally spaced points and for bacterial samples from P. syringae with 500 points. The 459 mean squared error MSE defines the accuracy of the determined set of parameters for the 460 distribution function. For further analysis, optimized results with the lowest MSE were 461 selected.

462

463 <u>Prediction of the Protein Structures with AlphaFold:</u>

464 AlphaFold (V2.0.1) and (V.2.3.2) were used for structure predictions with the required 465 databases downloaded from the AF2 GitHub repository (43). The best ranked AlphaFold 466 monomer model of the INP using V.2.01 contained a kink close to residue D555 (40). The 467 newer AlphaFold version predicts a straighter INP β-helix. However other ranked models 468 constructed by V.2.3.2 also exhibited kinks/twists (Fig. S4). The AlphaFold predictions of the 469 INP dimers and multimeric aggregates exhibited twisted and kinked structures (Fig. S4) that 470 do not match the observed high ice nucleation temperatures. All models were constructed using 471 the same settings except the maximal template date was set as 09-15-2021 for the old model, 472 and 08-30-2023 for the newer models.

473

474 <u>Prediction of the Ice Nucleation Temperatures of INP Aggregates:</u>

475 The HINT algorithm accurately implements numerical classical nucleation theory to predict 476 the heterogeneous nucleation temperature of ice on finite-sized surfaces using thermodynamic 477 and dynamic data from water, as well as the binding free energy of the IN to ice $\Delta\gamma_{\text{bind}}$ (2, 51). 478 With that data, HINT computes the free energy barriers for ice nucleation and the prefactor for

the nucleation rate, using as reference that the experimental ice nucleation rate $J_{exp} = 10^5$ 479 $cm^{-3}s^{-1}$ for microliter droplets cooled at 1 °C/min (52–54). We start by assuming that P. 480 481 syringae's INP binds ice as strong as ice itself, i.e., $\Delta \gamma_{\text{bind}} = -2 \gamma_{\text{ice-liquid}}$, as demonstrated in (2). 482 Additionally, we consider a line tension of $\tau = 10$ pN. The IN surface area is assumed to be 483 rectangular, with a width W = 3.4 nm and length L = 30 nm, consistent with the structure predicted by AlphaFold (40). We assume that functional aggregates with n INP have width W_n 484 485 $= n \ge 3.4$ nm and length L = 30 nm, consistent with the model of assembly we propose in this 486 study.

487 Using the HINT code, which models ice nuclei as cylinders with two half-spherical caps at 488 each end, we calculate the free energy cost ΔG for various configurations by adjusting the 489 number of water molecules N^* and the contact angle θ of the ice nucleus on the nucleating 490 surface (2). This allows us to identify the optimal size for ice growth with the lowest energy 491 cost, determined by the smallest ΔG for a specific number of water molecules. From this set, 492 we identify the ice nucleation barrier $\Delta G^*(T)$, which corresponds to the highest value of 493 $\Delta G^*(T)$ within a temperature range from T_m to T_{hom} , with a resolution of 0.1K. We continue 494 this computation until the calculated $\Delta G^*(T)$ matches the value derived from the homogeneous 495 nucleation rate (2).

496

497 <u>Membrane Fluidity Measurement:</u>

For the measurement of membrane fluidity, a 10 mM stock solution of the membrane dye 498 499 Laurdan in DMF was prepared. Aqueous samples of Snomax were prepared at a concentration 500 of 1mg/mL. Laurdan solution was added to a final concentration of 40 µM, and the samples 501 were stirred for 1 hour at 500rpm. The stained samples were washed twice to remove excess 502 dye, by centrifugation at 15,000x g for and after the final washing step, the samples were 503 subjected to the desired temperature using a thermomixer. Snomax samples containing 2-504 phenylethanol (50 mM) were equilibrated at 21°C. For temperature-dependent measurements, 505 Snomax samples were treated at different temperatures for 15 minutes. The temperature series started at 10°C and proceeded in 5°C intervals up to 50°C. Fluorescence measurements (TIDAS 506 507 FL3095 SL, J&M, Essingen, Germany) were performed using an excitation wavelength of 350 nm, and fluorescence emission was recorded from 370 to 800 nm. The integration time was set 508 509 to 10,000 ms and emission spectra were obtained by averaging three measurements. To

determine the membrane fluidity, the spectra were normalized and the generalized polarisation(*GP*) was calculated using

512
$$GP = \frac{I_{440\text{nm}} - I_{490\text{nm}}}{I_{440\text{nm}} + I_{490\text{nm}}}$$

where I_{440nm} is the fluorescence emission intensity at 440nm and I_{490nm} is the intensity at 490nm. High *GP* values correspond to low membrane fluidity and low values to high membrane fluidity.

516

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS. We are grateful to the MaxWater initiative from the Max Planck Society. K.M. acknowledges support by the NSF under Grant No. (NSF 2336558). I.d.A.R. and V.M. gratefully acknowledge the support by AFOSR through MURI Award No. FA9550-20-1-0351. We thank R. Schwidetzky, R. Eufemio, and D. Bell for assistance with ice nucleation measurement, and the Center for High Performance Computing at the University of Utah for an award of computing time and technical support. Steve Lindow is gratefully acknowledged for supplying the bacterial strain Cit7 and inspiring discussions.

524

525 Author Contributions. G.R., V. M., and K.M. designed research; G.R., I.d.A.R., and H.B.G. 526 performed research; G.R., I.d.A.R., R.B., V.M., and K.M. analyzed data; and G.R., I.d.A.R.,

527 M.B., J.F.-N., V.M., and K.M. wrote the paper.

528 **Competing Interest Statement.** The authors declare no competing interest.

529 Data, Materials, and Software Availability. All study data are included in the article and/or
530 SI Appendix.

531

532 **References:**

- S. E. Lindow, E. Lahue, A. G. Govindarajan, N. J. Panopoulos, D. Gies, Localization
 of Ice Nucleation Activity and the iceC Gene Product in Pseudomonas syringae and
 Escherichia coli. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 2, 262–272 (1989).
- 536 2. Y. Qiu, A. Hudait, V. Molinero, How Size and Aggregation of Ice-Binding Proteins
 537 Control Their Ice Nucleation Efficiency. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 141, 7439–7452 (2019).
- M. Lukas, R. Schwidetzky, R. J. Eufemio, M. Bonn, K. Meister, Toward
 Understanding Bacterial Ice Nucleation. J. Phys. Chem. B 126, 1861–1867 (2022).
- 540 4. L. M. Kozloff, M. A. Schofield, M. Lute, Ice nucleating activity of Pseudomonas

- 541 syringae and Erwinia herbicola. J. Bacteriol. 153, 222–231 (1983).
- 5. L. R. Maki, E. L. Galyan, M. M. Chang-Chien, D. R. Caldwell, Ice nucleation induced
 by pseudomonas syringae. *Appl. Microbiol.* 28, 456–459 (1974).
- 544 6. S. E. Lindow, D. C. Arny, C. D. Upper, Bacterial Ice Nucleation: A Factor in Frost
 545 Injury to Plants. *Plant Physiol.* 70, 1084–1089 (1982).
- 546 7. S. E. Lindow, D. C. Arny, C. D. Upper, Distribution of Ice Nucleation-Active Bacteria
 547 on Plants in Nature. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 36, 831–838 (1978).
- S. S. Hirano, C. D. Upper, Bacteria in the Leaf Ecosystem with Emphasis on
 Pseudomonas syringae —a Pathogen, Ice Nucleus, and Epiphyte. *Microbiol. Mol. Biol. Rev.* 64, 624–653 (2000).
- 551 9. C. E. Morris, *et al.*, The life history of the plant pathogen Pseudomonas syringae is 552 linked to the water cycle. *ISME J.* **2**, 321–334 (2008).
- 553 10. S. E. Lindow, The Role of Bacterial Ice Nucleation in Frost Injury to Plants. *Annu.*554 *Rev. Phytopathol.* 21, 363–384 (1983).
- J. A. Huffman, *et al.*, High concentrations of biological aerosol particles and ice nuclei
 during and after rain. *Atmos. Chem. Phys.* 13, 6151–6164 (2013).
- B. C. Christner, *et al.*, Geographic, seasonal, and precipitation chemistry influence on
 the abundance and activity of biological ice nucleators in rain and snow. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* 105, 18854–18859 (2008).
- A. B. Michaud, *et al.*, Biological ice nucleation initiates hailstone formation. J. *Geophys. Res. Atmos.* 119, 12186–12197 (2014).
- 562 14. J. Fröhlich-Nowoisky, *et al.*, Bioaerosols in the Earth system: Climate, health, and 563 ecosystem interactions. *Atmos. Res.* **182**, 346–376 (2016).
- A. Margaritis, A. S. Bassi, Principles and Biotechnological Applications of Bacterial
 Ice Nucleation. *Crit. Rev. Biotechnol.* 11, 277–295 (1991).
- 566 16. J. Li, T.-C. Lee, Bacterial ice nucleation and its potential application in the food
 567 industry. *Trends Food Sci. Technol.* 6, 259–265 (1995).
- T. Zwieg, V. Cucarella, M. Kauffeld, Novel biomimetically based ice-nucleating
 coatings. *Int. J. Mater. Res.* 98, 597–602 (2007).
- 570 18. F. P. Cid, *et al.*, Properties and biotechnological applications of ice-binding proteins in bacteria. *FEMS Microbiol. Lett.* 363, fnw099 (2016).
- 572 19. R. L. Green, G. J. Warren, Physical and functional repetition in a bacterial ice
 573 nucleation gene. *Nature* 317, 645–648 (1985).
- A. V. Kajava, S. E. Lindow, A Model of the Three-dimensional Structure of Ice
 Nucleation Proteins. J. Mol. Biol. 232, 709–717 (1993).
- 576 21. J. Forbes, *et al.*, Water-organizing motif continuity is critical for potent ice nucleation
 577 protein activity. *Nat. Commun.* 13, 5019 (2022).
- 578 22. C. P. Garnham, R. L. Campbell, V. K. Walker, P. L. Davies, Novel dimeric β-helical
 579 model of an ice nucleation protein with bridged active sites. *BMC Struct. Biol.* 11, 36
 580 (2011).
- A. Hudait, N. Odendahl, Y. Qiu, F. Paesani, V. Molinero, Ice-Nucleating and
 Antifreeze Proteins Recognize Ice through a Diversity of Anchored Clathrate and Ice-

583 like Motifs. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 140, 4905–4912 (2018). 584 24. S. Hartmann, et al., Structure and Protein-Protein Interactions of Ice Nucleation 585 Proteins Drive Their Activity. Front. Microbiol. 13 (2022). 586 25. A. G. Govindarajan, S. E. Lindow, Size of bacterial ice-nucleation sites measured in 587 situ by radiation inactivation analysis. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. 85, 1334–1338 (1988). 588 26. M. Lukas, et al., Interfacial Water Ordering Is Insufficient to Explain Ice-Nucleating 589 Protein Activity. J. Phys. Chem. Lett. 12, 218-223 (2021). 590 27. P. Wolber, G. Warren, Bacterial ice-nucleation proteins. Trends Biochem. Sci. 14, 591 179-182 (1989). 592 28. R. Pandey, et al., Ice-nucleating bacteria control the order and dynamics of interfacial 593 water. Sci. Adv. 2, 1-8 (2016). 594 S. P. Graether, Z. Jia, Modeling Pseudomonas syringae Ice-Nucleation Protein as a β-29. 595 Helical Protein. Biophys. J. 80, 1169-1173 (2001). 596 30. M. Lukas, et al., Electrostatic Interactions Control the Functionality of Bacterial Ice 597 Nucleators. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 142, 6842-6846 (2020). 598 31. M. W. Southworth, P. K. Wolber, G. J. Warren, Nonlinear relationship between 599 concentration and activity of a bacterial ice nucleation protein. J. Biol. Chem. 263, 600 15211–15216 (1988). 601 32. M. A. Turner, F. Arellano, L. M. Kozloff, Three separate classes of bacterial ice nucleation structures. J. Bacteriol. 172, 2521-2526 (1990). 602 603 33. R. Schwidetzky, et al., Membranes Are Decisive for Maximum Freezing Efficiency of Bacterial Ice Nucleators. J. Phys. Chem. Lett. 12, 10783-10787 (2021). 604 A. G. Govindarajan, S. E. Lindow, Phospholipid requirement for expression of ice 605 34. nuclei in Pseudomonas syringae and in vitro. J. Biol. Chem. 263, 9333-9338 (1988). 606 607 35. L. M. Kozloff, M. Lute, D. Westaway, Phosphatidylinositol as a Component of the Ice Nucleating Site of Pseudomonas syringae and Erwinia herbiola. Science (80-.). 226, 608 609 845-846 (1984). 610 36. R. Schwidetzky, et al., Specific Ion-Protein Interactions Influence Bacterial Ice Nucleation. Chem. - A Eur. J. 27, 7402–7407 (2021). 611 612 R. Schwidetzky, et al., Inhibition of Bacterial Ice Nucleators Is Not an Intrinsic 37. 613 Property of Antifreeze Proteins. J. Phys. Chem. B 124, 4889-4895 (2020). 614 38. C. Budke, T. Koop, BINARY: an optical freezing array for assessing temperature and 615 time dependence of heterogeneous ice nucleation. Atmos. Meas. Tech. 8, 689-703 616 (2015). 617 I. de Almeida Ribeiro, K. Meister, V. Molinero, HUB: a method to model and extract 39. the distribution of ice nucleation temperatures from drop-freezing experiments. Atmos. 618 619 Chem. Phys. 23, 5623–5639 (2023). 620 40. H.-B. Guo, et al., AlphaFold2 models indicate that protein sequence determines both 621 structure and dynamics. Sci. Rep. 12, 10696 (2022). 622 41. S. Hartmann, et al., Immersion freezing of ice nucleation active protein complexes. 623 Atmos. Chem. Phys. 13, 5751-5766 (2013). 624 H. Wex, et al., Intercomparing different devices for the investigation of ice nucleating 42.

- 625 particles using Snomax® as test substance. *Atmos. Chem. Phys.* **15**, 1463–1485 (2015).
- 43. J. Jumper, *et al.*, Highly accurate protein structure prediction with AlphaFold. *Nature*596, 583–589 (2021).
- 44. R. L. Green, L. V. Corotto, G. J. Warren, Deletion mutagenesis of the ice nucleation
 gene from Pseudomonas syringae S203. *MGG Mol. Gen. Genet.* 215, 165–172 (1988).
- 45. T. Hansen, *et al.*, Ice nucleation proteins self-assemble into large fibres to trigger
 freezing at near 0 °C. *Elife* 12, 1–37 (2023).
- 63246.A. V. Kajava, A. C. Steven, "β-Rolls, β-Helices, and Other β-Solenoid Proteins" in633Advances in Protein Chemistry, (2006), pp. 55–96.
- 634 47. P. Rassam, *et al.*, Supramolecular assemblies underpin turnover of outer membrane
 635 proteins in bacteria. *Nature* 523, 333–336 (2015).
- 48. L. D. Ginez, *et al.*, Changes in fluidity of the E. coli outer membrane in response to
 temperature, divalent cations and polymyxin-B show two different mechanisms of
 membrane fluidity adaptation. *FEBS J.* 289, 3550–3567 (2022).
- A. T. Kunert, *et al.*, Twin-plate Ice Nucleation Assay (TINA) with infrared detection
 for high-throughput droplet freezing experiments with biological ice nuclei in
 laboratory and field samples. *Atmos. Meas. Tech.* 11, 6327–6337 (2018).
- 642 50. G. Vali, Quantitative Evaluation of Experimental Results on the Heterogeneous
 643 Freezing Nucleation of Supercooled Liquids. J. Atmos. Sci. 28, 402–409 (1971).
- 51. Y. Qiu, *et al.*, Ice Nucleation Efficiency of Hydroxylated Organic Surfaces Is
 Controlled by Their Structural Fluctuations and Mismatch to Ice. J. Am. Chem. Soc.
 139, 3052–3064 (2017).
- 52. T. Koop, B. Luo, A. Tsias, T. Peter, Water activity as the determinant for
 homogeneous ice nucleation in aqueous solutions. *Nature* 406, 611–614 (2000).
- 53. T. Koop, B. J. Murray, A physically constrained classical description of the
 homogeneous nucleation of ice in water. J. Chem. Phys. 145, 211915 (2016).
- 54. L. Kaufmann, C. Marcolli, B. Luo, T. Peter, Refreeze experiments with water droplets
 containing different types of ice nuclei interpreted by classical nucleation theory. *Atmos. Chem. Phys.* 17, 3525–3552 (2017).