Electrolytic seawater mineralization and how it ensures 1 (net) carbon dioxide removal 2 3 Erika Callagon La Plante, ^{1,2,3,4,*} Xin Chen,^{2,4,5} Steven Bustillos,^{2,5,6} Arnaud Bouissonnie,^{2,5} Thomas 4 5 Traynor,^{2,4} David Jassby,^{2,4,5} Lorenzo Corsini,⁴ Dante Simonetti,^{2,4,6} and Gaurav Sant^{2,4,5,7,8,*} 6 7 ¹ Department of Materials Science and Engineering, University of Texas at Arlington, Arlington, TX 8 9 ² Institute for Carbon Management, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, CA ³ Center for Advanced Construction Materials, University of Texas at Arlington, Arlington, TX 10 ⁴ Equatic Inc., Los Angeles, CA 11 ⁵ Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, CA 12 ⁶ Department of Chemical and Biomolecular Engineering, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, CA 13 ⁷ California Nanosystems Institute, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, CA 14 ⁸ Department of Materials Science and Engineering, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, CA 15 16 * Corresponding authors: erika.laplante@uta.edu; gsant@ucla.edu 17 18 ABSTRACT: We present the mass balances associated with carbon dioxide (CO₂) removal (CDR) 19 using seawater as both the source of reactants, and as the reaction medium via electrolysis 20 following the "EquaticTM" (formerly known as "SeaChange") process. The process involves the 21 application of an overpotential that splits water to form H⁺ and OH⁻ ions, producing acidity and 22 alkalinity, i.e., in addition to gaseous co-products, at the anode and cathode, respectively. The 23 alkalinity that results, i.e., via the "continuous electrolytic pH pump" results in the 24 instantaneous precipitation of calcium carbonate ($CaCO_3$), magnesium carbonates (Mg– CO_3), and/or magnesium hydroxide (Mg(OH)₂) depending on the CO_3^{2-} activity in solution. This results 25 26 in the trapping, and hence durable and permanent (at least ~10,000–100,000 years) 27 immobilization of CO₂ that was originally dissolved in water, and that is additionally drawn 28 down from the atmosphere within: a) mineral carbonates, and/or b) as solvated bicarbonate (HCO_3^{-}) and carbonate (CO_3^{2-}) ions (i.e., due to the absorption of atmospheric CO_2 into 29 30 seawater having enhanced alkalinity). Taken together, these actions result in the net removal of 31 up to ≈ 4.6 kg of CO₂ per m³ of seawater processed. Geochemical simulations quantify the 32 extents of net CO₂ removal including the dependencies on the process configuration. It is 33 furthermore indicated that the efficiency of realkalinization of the acidic anolyte using alkaline 34 solids depends on their H⁺ neutralization capacity and dissolution reactivity. We also assess 35 changes in seawater chemistry resulting from $Mg(OH)_2$ dissolution with emphasis on the 36 change in its alkalinity and saturation state. Overall, this analysis provides direct quantifications

of the ability of the EquaticTM process to serve as a means for technological CDR to mitigate the

- 38 worst effects of accelerating climate change.
- 39

40 Keywords: Carbon dioxide mineralization, calcium carbonate, magnesium carbonate, brucite,

41 carbon dioxide removal (CDR), electrolysis

42 INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

43 The trapping of carbon dioxide (CO₂) as an aqueous (bi)carbonate ion (e.g., HCO_3^- , CO_3^{2-} 44) or as a mineral solid ("mineralization") is attractive because of favorable thermodynamics, and 45 the safety and permanence of storage.¹⁻³ Furthermore, mineralization is a cost-effective pathway for CO₂ sequestration/removal (CDR), which at steady state, is estimated to cost 46 47 <\$100 per tonne (t) of CO₂.¹ During CO₂ mineralization, the release of Ca and Mg from the 48 precursor solids is rate limiting, unless mass transport is limiting; which is seldom the case.⁴ 49 Thus, providing pre-solubilized cations that can readily react with CO₂ enormously facilitates 50 mineralization rates and extents. Seawater is a vast reservoir of divalent cations (Ca, Mg) and 51 dissolved CO₂ that can form sparingly soluble carbonates (and/or hydroxides). Long-term 52 (millions of years) storage of CO_2 on Earth occurs by mineralization through the formation of 53 calcite (CaCO₃) and aragonite (CaCO₃). But, over the short term, the abiotic precipitation of Ca-54 and Mg-carbonates from seawater is kinetically inhibited, as implied by the supersaturation of 55 oceans with respect to these minerals.

56

57 The oceans absorb and immobilize atmospherically derived CO_2 in the form of dissolved 58 carbonate species (i.e., predominantly HCO_3^- at a prevailing pH of ~8.1). Such aqueous immobilization is highly durable, although less so than mineral carbonate formation (i.e., with a 59 stability of up to billions of years),^{5,6} and presents a lower bound of stability in excess of 10,000 60 61 years.^{7,8} As a result, 25% of all anthropogenic CO_2 emissions (~9 gigatonnes, Gt) are removed 62 from the atmosphere by the oceans annually.⁹ But, as a function of their prevailing chemistry, 63 and ongoing ocean acidification, the capacity of the oceans to absorb any additional CO₂ (i.e., 64 annually and per unit of seawater) is capped, unless prevalent CO₂ were to be removed. Toward 65 this end, i.e., to remove CO₂ from the oceans and to expand the capacity of seawater to absorb 66 additional CO₂, several electrochemical processes have been proposed, which focus on 67 increasing ocean alkalinity via the: (a) production of OH⁻ from seawater (and the utilization of 68 the HCl co-product to accelerate silicate weathering),¹⁰ (b) using hard water and ion-exchange 69 membranes,^{11,12} or (c) utilizing pH swing processes to extract and capture CO₂.^{13,14}

70

71 Recently, we proposed an approach to rapidly precipitate Ca- and Mg- carbonates and hydroxides from seawater to achieve CDR.¹⁵ This *EquaticTM* process electrolytically forces 72 73 mineral carbonate precipitation thereby consuming prevalent CO₂ that is dissolved in seawater 74 by locking it within carbonate minerals, and simultaneously producing alkaline mineral 75 hydroxides that when dissolved in seawater enable the drawdown of atmospheric CO₂ into the seawater, representing net CO₂ removal.¹⁵ This paper describes the CO₂ (mass) balances of this 76 77 approach. Two scenarios are presented: (1) the precipitation of magnesium and calcium 78 carbonates, i.e., a condition relevant to elevated carbonate activity, i.e., at super-ambient CO₂ 79 concentrations, and (2) the precipitation of calcium carbonate and magnesium hydroxide 80 (Mg(OH)₂: brucite), i.e., as relevant to ambient carbonate activity in seawater and atmospheric 81 concentrations of CO₂. The analysis offers a quantitative basis for assessing the CDR potential of 82 the technological approach and developing a robust measurement, reporting, and verification 83 (MRV) strategy. 84

86 ANALYSIS METHODS

We use PHREEQC¹⁶ to carry out detailed geochemical simulations. The llnl.dat database was used, which is appropriate for ionic strengths up to seawater salinity. The seawater

composition used is based on Millero et al. (2008) (**Table 1**),¹⁷ adjusted to pCO_2 (in atm) = -3.38

- 90 (420 ppm)¹⁸ by charge balancing for the presence of inorganic C (carbon) species. The
- 91 Saturation Index (SI) is defined as log Ω , where the saturation ratio, $\Omega = Q/K_{sp}$, and Q is the ion
- 92 activity product and K_{sp} is the solubility product with respect to a given mineral. The saturation
- 93 indices and ratios with respect to relevant Mg- and Ca-based minerals in seawater are shown in
- 94 **Table 2**. In brief, seawater is supersaturated with respect to aragonite, calcite, dolomite, and

95 magnesite, and undersaturated with respect to hydrated magnesium carbonates and brucite.

- All the calculations assume thermodynamic equilibrium for T = 25 °C, p = 1 bar (1 atm).
- 97 98
- Table 1. The composition of seawater used in the analysis.

Creation	Molality (<i>m</i> , mol/kg)	Molality (<i>m</i> , mol/kg)
species	based on Reference Composition ¹⁷	after equilibration at 420 ppm $CO_{2(g)}$
Na ⁺	0.4860597	0.4860597
Mg ²⁺	0.0547421	0.0547421
Ca ²⁺	0.0106568	0.0106568
K⁺	0.0105797	0.0105797
Sr ²⁺	0.0000940	0.0000940
Cl⁻	0.5657647	0.5657647
SO4 ²⁻	0.0292643	0.0292643
HCO₃ [−]	0.0017803	0.0021002
Br⁻	0.0008728	0.0008728
CO ₃ ²⁻	0.0002477	0.0000312
F⁻	0.0000708	0.0000708
B [B(OH) ₄ ⁻ , B(OH) ₃]	0.0004303	0.0004303
$H_2CO_3^*$	0.0000100	0.0000124
ΣCO_2	2.038 mmol/kg	2.141 mmol/kg
рН	8.352	8.170
pCO ₂ (in atm)	-3.78	-3.38

Table 2. The saturation indices and ratios of different mineral solids in seawater.

Phase	Composition	Saturation Index, SI	Saturation Ratio, Ω
Aragonite	CaCO₃	0.52	3.311
Artinite	Mg ₂ CO ₃ (OH) ₂ ·6H ₂ O	-1.97	0.011
Brucite	Mg(OH) ₂	-1.84	0.014
Calcite	CaCO₃	0.67	4.677
Dolomite	CaMg(CO ₃) ₂	3.26	1819.7
Huntite	CaMg ₃ (CO ₃) ₄	1.99	97.72
Hydromagnesite	Mg ₅ (CO ₃) ₄ (OH) ₂ ·4H ₂ O	-3.38	0.0004
Lansfordite	MgCO₃·5H₂O	-1.64	0.023
Magnesite	MgCO ₃	0.97	9.333
Nesquehonite	MgCO ₃ ·3H ₂ O	-2.07	0.009

102 The CO_2 content (i.e., storage capacity) of seawater is dependent on its alkalinity. The 103 total alkalinity (A_T , mg/L) of seawater is given by: $A_7 = [HCO_3^-] + 2 [CO_3^{2-}] + [OH^-] + [B(OH)_4^-] + HPO_4^{2-}] + 2 [PO_4^{3-}] + [H_3SiO_4^-] + [NH_3] +$ 104 105 $[HS^{-}] + 2 [S^{2-}] - [H^{+}] - [HF] - [HSO_{4}^{-}] - H_{3}PO_{4}]$ 106 or equivalently: 107 $A_T = [Na^+] + 2 [Mg^{2+}] + 2 [Ca^{2+}] + [K^+] + 2 [Sr^{2+}] - [Cl^-] - [Br^-] + (...) + \Sigma NH_3 + \Sigma NO_3 + \Sigma NO_2$ 108 + ΣPO_4 + ΣSO_4 + ΣF 109 where (...) represents minor conservative species, $\Sigma NH_3 = NH_3 + NH_4^+$, $\Sigma NO_3 = NO_3^- +$ 110 HNO_3 , $\Sigma NO_2 = NO_2^- + HNO_2$, $\Sigma PO_4 = H_3PO_4 + H_2PO_4^- + HPO_4^{2-} + PO_4^{3-}$, $\Sigma SO_4 = H_2SO_4 + HSO_4^- + HSO_4^{3-}$ 111 SO_4^{2-} and $\Sigma F = HF + F^{-}.^{19-21}$

112

113 **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

114 Carbon dioxide dissolution in seawater: The equilibrium of gas-phase CO₂ with seawater is

115 described in detail elsewhere.^{22–24} Briefly, the dissolved CO₂ content in seawater is controlled

- by its pH, the atmospheric partial pressure of CO_2 (*pCO*₂), and the temperature as described by
- Henry's law. The relative concentrations of HCO_3^- , CO_3^{2-} , and $H_2CO_3^+$ which denotes the sum of
- H₂CO₃ (carbonic acid) and aqueous CO₂, [HCO₃⁻], [CO₃^{2–}], and [H₂CO₃*], are determined via the
- equilibrium constants, K_H , K_1 , and K_2 (see Eq. 1-3) which are functions of the temperature and
- 120 the salinity of the water:²³

$$[H_2 C O_3^*] = K_H P_{CO_2}$$
 (Eq. 1)

$$[HCO_3^-] = \frac{K_1}{[H^+]} \times [H_2CO_3^*]$$
(Eq. 2)

$$[CO_3^{2-}] = \frac{K_2}{[H^+]} \times [HCO_3^-]$$
(Eq. 3)

Here, Eq. 1 is Henry's law, where K_H is the Henry's law constant (0.03428 mol/L/atm for 121 122 freshwater (0 per mil, ‰) and 0.02858 for seawater (35 ‰)), and P is the partial pressure in 123 atm (i.e., 420 ppm is equivalent to 0.00042 atm). The equilibrium constant, K_1 is taken as 4.498 124 \times 10⁻⁷ mol/kg for freshwater and 14.52 \times 10⁻⁷ mol/kg for seawater, whereas K₂ is taken as 0.479 \times 10⁻¹⁰ mol/kg for freshwater and 11.12 \times 10⁻¹⁰ mol/kg for seawater.^{23,25} The concentration of 125 aqueous H⁺, is equivalent to 10^{-pH} (where the ionic product of water $K_w = 10^{-14}$). The speciation 126 of CO₂ and the relative abundances of HCO_3^- and CO_3^{2-} show a strong dependence on the pH 127 128 (Fig. 1a). On the other hand, $H_2CO_3^*$ is controlled by pCO₂ and is independent of pH. The 129 equilibrium between H₂CO₃ and CO_{2(aq)} is given by: $[H_2CO_3] = K_0[CO_{2(aq)}]$, where $pK_0 = 2.97$, 130 indicating that $CO_{2(aq)}$ is ~1000 times more abundant than H_2CO_3 .²⁶ Thus, the total dissolved CO_2 131 (total dissolved inorganic carbon: DIC, ΣCO_2) is given by the sum of the different carbon species and is equal to: $\Sigma CO_2 = [H_2 CO_3^*] + [HCO_3^-] + [CO_3^2^-]$. At pH 8.1 and 420 ppm CO₂, the total 132 133 dissolved CO₂ concentrations in freshwater and seawater based on this analysis are 0.847 mmol 134 CO₂/kg water and 2.557 mmol CO₂/kg water, in reasonable agreement with **Table 1** albeit with 135 a discrepancy that is caused by differences in the equilibrium constants that are used.²⁷ 136 Notably, the equilibrium ΣCO_2 in seawater is greater than that in freshwater because of the 137 higher ionic strength of seawater that results in the speciation of CO_2 into HCO_3^- and CO_3^{2-} by complexation of the bicarbonate and carbonate ions with cations such as Na⁺, Mg²⁺, and Ca²⁺ 138 139 (see Fig. 1b-c).





Figure 1. (a) The concentration and speciation of CO₂ in seawater (solid curves) and freshwater (dashed curves) in equilibrium with an ambient atmosphere containing 420 ppm CO₂ (0.042 vol. % CO₂). The total dissolved CO₂ is the sum of the concentrations of HCO₃⁻, CO₃²⁻ and H₂CO₃*. H₂CO₃* represents the sum of CO_{2(aq)} and true carbonic acid (H₂CO₃). The speciation of CO₂ is calculated using equilibrium constants that vary with temperature and salinity.²³ (b) The detail of (a) for 8≤pH≤9, showing the far greater solubility of CO₂ in seawater than freshwater. (c) The different aqueous species of dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC), including complexes with dissolved cations in seawater, and their relative amounts. The concentrations for each species are given in mol/kg (molal basis).

141

142 *Electrolytic carbon removal:* The *EquaticTM* process consists of the following steps:

143 <u>Step 1</u>) The precipitation of magnesium carbonate (magnesite, MgCO₃, at super-ambient pCO₂;

- 144 >1 atm)²⁸ or magnesium hydroxide and magnesium hydroxy-carbonates (at ambient pCO₂),
- 145 <u>Step 2</u>) The precipitation of calcium carbonate (CaCO₃),

146 <u>Step 3a</u>) The realkalinization of the anolyte stream to replenish the divalent cations, and

147 <u>Step 3b</u>) The dissolution of precipitated Mg(OH)₂ and the absorption of atmospheric CO₂ (Fig. 2)

148 into a solution having an elevated pH. All the process steps including (3a-3b) occur prior to the

- 149 discharge of the seawater effluent.¹⁵
- 150

151 Ultimately, the process traps CO_2 in: (a) dissolved (i.e., aqueous HCO_3^- and CO_3^{2-} species stabilized via the re-dissolution of $Mg(OH)_2$) and/or, (b) solid (e.g., CaCO₃, a mineral carbonate) 152 153 forms. This manner of CDR is represented by two limiting cases: (**Case 1**) $CaCO_3 + Mg(OH)_2$ (i.e., 154 89 mass % aqueous, 11 mass % solid CO₂ immobilization), and (Case 2) CaCO₃ + MgCO₃ (i.e., 100 155 mass % solid CO_2 immobilization), and (Case 3) which implies the formation of a mixture of 156 Mg(OH)₂ and MgCO₃ alongside CaCO₃. The solids produced via this process, predominantly 157 CaCO₃, can be discharged back into the ocean, where they will remain stable because of their 158 native prevalence and persistence (e.g., seashells in the ocean), and seawater's supersaturation

159 with respect to these mineral carbonates (**Table 2**), or beneficially utilized, e.g., as sand in

- 160 concrete, or as a carbon-neutral source to produce cement. Obviously, if hydrated carbonate
- 161 phases including nesquehonite (MgCO₃·3H₂O), lansfordite (MgCO₃·5H₂O), hydromagnesite
- 162 (Mg₅(CO₃)₄(OH)₂·4H₂O), and dypingite (Mg₅(CO₃)₄(OH)₂·5H₂O) form, alternative disposal
- 163 strategies (e.g., on land) will need to be used due to the tendency of these solids to dissolve if
- 164 they were discharged into seawater (**Table 2**).

- 165
- From stoichiometry, the formation of 1 mole of CaCO₃ or MgCO₃ captures 1 mole of CO₂, while requiring 2 moles of OH⁻. For comparison, only 1.2 moles of OH⁻ are required per mole of CO₂ stored as dissolved (bicarbonate: HCO_3^- and carbonate: CO_3^{2-}) ions (**Fig. 1** and **7**).^{7,15} This implies that per unit of alkalinity, it is more chemically and energy efficient to store CO₂ in the
- 170 form of dissolved aqueous carbonates, i.e., rather than mineral carbonate species. The
- 171 EquaticTM process is based on the electrolysis of seawater. Such electrochemical stimulation of
- 172 seawater implies the formation of alkalinity (OH^{-}) at the cathode, and acidity (H^{+}) at the anode.
- 173 In addition, gas phase co-products evolve, including hydrogen $(H_{2(g)})$ at the cathode, and oxygen
- 174 $(O_{2(g)})$ and chlorine $(Cl_{2(g)})$ at the anode. These gas evolutions are described by the hydrogen
- evolution reaction (HER), oxygen evolution reaction (OER), and chlorine evolution reaction
- 176 (CIER), respectively. During seawater electrolysis, unless an oxygen-selective anode is used,
- 177 CIER is the predominant reaction at the anode because its 2e⁻ basis (i.e., as compared to the 4e⁻
- 178 basis of OER) makes it kinetically more favorable.



Figure 2. A schematic of the Equatic¹ process showing the inlet and outlet feeds and energy requirements of the primary steps for CO₂ removal as: carbonate solids and (aqueous) dissolved CO₂ (Case 1) and carbonate solids only (Case 2). The major energy inputs include electrolysis, water handling, and rock grinding.¹⁵

179

180 The EquaticTM process can be examined for a system that removes 1 t of CO_2 per day 181 (TPD). This system requires the processing of \sim 220 m³ per day of seawater to yield 235 kg of 182 CaCO₃ and 702 kg of Mg(OH)₂ (i.e., if the solids were suspended in the solution this translates to 183 \approx 3.3 mass % solids, corresponding to a dilute system) while assuming a CO₂ removal efficiency 184 of 1.7 mol CO₂ per mol Mg(OH)₂ (see below). In addition, ~29 kg of H_{2(g)}, ~46 kg of O_{2(g)}, and 185 ~818 kg of chlorine (Cl_{2(g)}, HClO, and ClO⁻) are produced when using an anode that is not OER-186 selective (e.g., platinum). The amount of free chlorine generated can be reduced greatly by the 187 use of oxygen-selective anodes, without compromising the overpotential, and achieving >98 188 mass % selectivity to the OER as compared to CIER – a fast maturing effort which addresses 189 obvious issues related to toxicity, handling, and atmospheric release of chlorine, and chlorine 190 derivatives. For these considerations, **Case 1** yields net 4.6 kg of CO₂ removal per m³ of seawater. For Case 1, CO2 removal via the alkalinity enhancement enabled by the dissolution of 191

192 brucite (Mg(OH)₂) can be effected in the ocean, i.e., following discharge of the brucite, or within

a captive carbonation/aeration reactor wherein air is pumped/bubbled into the solution and

194 CO₂ absorption and bicarbonate/carbonate ion formation occur following Henry's Law (further 195 discussion below) (**Fig. 2**).

196

197 Alternatively, **Case 2** requires 348 m³ per day of seawater and will produce 371 kg of 198 CaCO₃ and 1606 kg of MgCO₃ (i.e., if the solids were suspended in the solution this translates to 199 \approx 5.7 mass % solids, corresponding to a dilute system). In addition, ~46 kg of H_{2(g)}, ~73 kg of O_{2(g)}, 200 and ~1295 kg of free chlorine ($Cl_{2(g)}$, HClO, and ClO⁻) are produced when using a platinum-based 201 anode that is not OER-selective. Thus, **Case 2** yields net 2.9 kg of CO_2 removal per m³ of 202 seawater. It should be noted, however, that **Case 2** requires elevated pCO_2 to force the 203 precipitation of MgCO₃, even at high pH. As such, Case 2 implies the bubbling of concentrated 204 CO_2 into seawater, and therefore requires integration with a fractional direct air capture (DAC) 205 system or a CO₂-enriched flue gas emissions stream. The mass and energy inputs relevant to 206 **Case 1** and **Case 2** are shown schematically in **Figure 2** and are described elsewhere.¹⁵

207

208 Precipitation of calcium carbonate and magnesium hydroxide: The ocean is supersaturated with 209 respect to aragonite by factors of at least 2-3 (Table 1), implying that the kinetic inhibition of precipitation is operative.²⁹ With decreasing Ω , the time elapsed before the onset of 210 211 precipitation increases gradually at $\Omega > 3$ and then sharply at $\Omega \sim 3$, implying seawater stability at $\Omega < 3.^{30}$ This kinetic inhibition of precipitation is caused by dissolved organic matter, 31,32 212 213 phosphate ions,³³ magnesium ions,³⁴ and sulfate ions.³⁵ To overcome the kinetic hindrance to 214 precipitation we alkalinize the electrolyte such that, e.g., at pH 10-12, in the vicinity of the 215 cathode we ensure Ω > 1400 (at pH 10) for calcite, and Ω > 7 (at pH 10) for brucite for a solution 216 in equilibrium with air: i.e., saturation ratios which are more than sufficient to overcome the 217 thermodynamic and kinetic barriers to mineral precipitation.

218

219 If uncompensated, the precipitation of Ca and Mg-minerals from seawater at the 220 cathode would lead to a net lower seawater pH and hence a reduction in its dissolved CO_2 221 storage capacity; as a function of CO_2 's pH-dependent solubility in water (Fig. 3a). Similarly, the 222 decrease of the pH of the anolyte in an electrolysis system to pH \approx 1 results in CO₂'s degassing to 223 a limit of 2.141 mmol CO_2/kg seawater as described by Henry's law (Fig. 1a). But on the other 224 hand, the net increase in the pH of the catholyte, on account of the electrolytic pH pump, and 225 the subsequent dissolution of brucite, increases the amount of CO₂ absorbed very significantly 226 (Fig. 1a), far exceeding the amount of CO_2 degassed at the anolyte. For example, maintaining a 227 fixed catholyte pH of 8.5, 9.0, and 9.5, just within the electrolytic reactor and not including the 228 OH⁻ liberated following the dissolution of brucite, yields an *additional* 2.787, 17.72, and 86.54 229 mmol CO₂/kg water of storage vis-à-vis the native pH of seawater (≈8.1) [N.B.: under 230 operational conditions, the electrochemical reactors maintain a pH≈10-12 in the vicinity of the cathode]. This suggests that the Equatic[™] process can be used to enhance seawater's CO₂ 231 232 storage capacity, while also accomplishing atmospheric CO_2 removal. This is in contrast to 233 traditional direct air capture (DAC) processes since a decrease in atmospheric CO₂ 234 concentrations, if effected in isolation via DAC, would result in the degassing of CO₂ from the 235 oceans on account of the ocean-atmosphere partitioning equilibrium of CO₂ (Eq. 1).^{15,36}

- 236 237 Expectedly, if the catholyte effluent is not in equilibrium with atmospheric CO_2 , re-238 equilibration, i.e., the progressive absorption of CO_2 from the air will decrease its pH (**Fig. 3b**). 239 Thus, our simulations show that an exit (effluent) pH \approx 11.5 is required to maintain a pH \geq 8.5 240 upon equilibration with atmospheric CO_2 , for a catholyte effluent that is depleted in aqueous Ca²⁺ and Mg²⁺ ions (i.e., where Ca and Mg are contained within mineral solids). It is furthermore 241 important to highlight that in the *Equatic*[™] process, due to the provisioning of a continuous 242 243 (electrolytic) pH pump, the precipitation of mineral carbonates does not result in the degassing of CO₂ (i.e., due to acidification that results from the deprotonation of bicarbonate ions: HCO₃⁻, 244 245 during carbonate mineralization), as is the case for non-electrolytically stimulated conditions.
- 246



Figure 3. (a) The evolution of total dissolved CO₂ (ΣCO₂) and the pH of seawater with increasing Ca²⁺ and Mg²⁺ precipitation as CaCO₃, MgCO₃ and/or Mg(OH)₂, (b) The equilibration with air of the catholyte effluent for pHs ranging from 9.5 to 13, where the catholyte is depleted of divalent cations and CO₂. The figure shows different extents of pH decrease (red–blue curves) with progressive CO₂ absorption as pCO₂ (gray curves) approaches –3.38 (i.e., atmospheric concentrations). For pCO₂ evolution, increasing darkness of the gray curves corresponds to increasing initial pH of the catholyte effluent.

247

248 *Realkalinization of the catholyte and anolyte effluent*: The discharge of the catholyte (i.e.,

249 depleted of Ca and Mg) and anolyte (i.e., an acidic solution) effluent into the ocean could result

250 in changes in seawater chemistry and saturation states (e.g., a decrease in SI with respect to

aragonite, a reduced CO₂ storage capacity, etc., **Table 2**, **Table 3**). To counter such effects

252 requires the remineralization of the effluent by the dissolution of alkaline minerals such as

253 those found in mafic and ultramafic rocks into the anolyte, to elevate the concentrations of

254 divalent cations. Candidate solutes for this include pyroxenes (e.g., augite

255 [(Ca,Na)(Mg,Fe,Al,Ti)(Si,Al)₂O₆], diopside [MgCaSi₂O₆]) and olivines (e.g., forsterite [Mg₂SiO₄])

that naturally occur in mafic (basalts, gabbro) and ultramafic (peridotites) rocks. As Ca²⁺ and

257 Mg²⁺ species are dissolved into the effluent, its pH and total dissolved CO₂ content elevate (Fig.

4). It is evident that an increase in the ΣCO_2 occurs only when the pH exceeds ~5 (**Fig. 1a**).

259 Furthermore, the replenishment of the cations increases not only the pH but also the salinity,

260 enabling further CO₂ absorption (**Fig. 1b-c**, **4b**) – a reason why seawater contains much more

dissolved CO₂ than freshwater.

263 264	Table 3	The representat	ive steady-st exiting th
		Species	l af
		Na ⁺	
		Mg ²⁺	
		Ca ²⁺	

Table 3. The representative steady-state composition of the anolyte and catholyte effluentexiting the electrolyzer (see Fig. 2).

Anolyte

Species	Molality (mol/kg)	Catholyte
Species	after equilibration at	Molality (mol/kg)
	420 ppm	
Na ⁺	0.4110597	0.6228000
Mg ²⁺	0.0547421	0
Ca ²⁺	0.0106568	0.0083568
K ⁺	0.0105797	0.0105797
Sr ²⁺	0.0000940	0.0000940
Cl⁻	0.6367647	0.5680000
SO ₄ ²⁻	0.0292643	0.0292643
HCO ₃ ⁻	1.106×10^{-10}	0
Br [_]	0.0008728	0.0008728
CO ₃ ²⁻	1.506×10^{-19}	0
F [−]	0.0000708	0.0000708
B [B(OH) ₄ ⁻ , B(OH) ₃]	0.0004303	0.0004303
$H_2CO_3^*$	0.0000164	0
ΣCO_2	0.0000164	0
CaCO ₃ (s)	0	0.002
Mg(OH) ₂ (s)	0	0.055
рН	1.023	12.200
pCO ₂	-3.38	-

265

262

266 The quantity of rock required to replenish the cation abundance, and the pH of the 267 combined (catholyte and anolyte) effluent is a function of the solute's acid ([H⁺], proton) 268 neutralization capacity (ANC). This capacity can be calculated from the solute's oxide 269 composition assuming progressive dissolution, and a dissolution reaction (congruent: 270 stoichiometric (e.g., Mg₂SiO_{4(s)} (forsterite) + 4H⁺ \rightarrow 2Mg²⁺ + H₄SiO₄), or incongruent: non-271 stoichiometric (e.g., CaAl₂Si₂O_{8(s)} (anorthite) + 2H⁺ + H₂O \rightarrow Ca²⁺ + Al₂Si₂O₅(OH)_{4(s)})).⁴ For 272 simplicity we consider complete and congruent dissolution (Table 4, Fig. 5) to identify the 273 maximum ANC. A range of compositions for these minerals yield ANCs of up to \approx 50 mol H⁺/kg 274 solid (i.e., for MgO). This translates to a theoretical mass (and volume) requirement of 1.60 g Mg₂SiO₄/g CO₂ sequestered (0.49 cm³ Mg₂SiO₄/g CO₂) or 2.36 g CaAl₂Si₂O₈/g CO₂ (0.86 cm³ 275 CaAl₂Si₂O₈/g CO₂) to replenish Mg²⁺ or Ca²⁺ removed by MgCO₃ and CaCO₃ precipitation (Case 276 277 **2**). For **Case 1**, since the dissolution of $Mg(OH)_2$ will autogenously replenish Mg^{2+} in seawater, 278 only Ca^{2+} depletion needs to be considered, resulting in a solid requirement of 0.76 g 279 $CaAl_2Si_2O_8/g CO_2$ (0.28 cm³ CaAl_2Si_2O_8/g CO_2). However, to additionally neutralize the acidity of 280 the anolyte (i.e., OH⁻ from Mg(OH)₂ dissolution is counted toward CO₂ sequestration and thus 281 cannot be double counted for acidity neutralization), an additional quantity of 1.07 g Mg₂SiO₄/g 282 CO_2 (0.45 cm³ Mg₂SiO₄/g CO₂) is required.

284 The lower alkalinity requirement for **Case 1** is a result of the greater CO_2 removal 285 efficiency of Mg(OH)₂ compared with MgCO₃ (i.e., since only 1.2 moles of OH⁻ are required per 286 mole of CO₂ stored as dissolved bicarbonate (HCO₃⁻) ions). For either case, if the catholyte 287 effluent, i.e., including the suspended solids were to be discharged into the ocean, the CaCO₃ 288 and MgCO₃ (if any) that are present would remain stable, i.e., they would not dissolve given the 289 significant oversaturation of the oceans with respect to these minerals (see Table 2). That said, 290 we recognize that effluent alkalization (i.e., ensuring equivalence of the pH of the influent and 291 the combined, anolyte + catholyte effluent), and divalent cation regeneration (i.e., abundances 292 of Ca and Mg in the influent and combined effluent are equal) are prerequisite to discharge the 293 effluent back into the ocean. But, beyond chemical considerations, other aspects require 294 further work. For example, it is known that the [Ca/Mg] ratio in the oceans is of relevance to 295 calcifying organisms, particularly the stability of their calcified exoskeletons in an acidifying ocean.^{37–40} While we cannot yet assess if the *Equatic*[™] process, if globally deployed for 10s of 296 297 gigatonnes of CDR annually would affect such aspects (albeit, not at the scale of single plants), 298 further work is needed to better understand these details in due course.

299



Figure 4. (a) The total dissolved inorganic carbon (Σ CO₂) in the anolyte following dissolution (alkalinization) of Ca- or Mg-rich solids (e.g., Ca₂SiO₄ or Mg₂SiO₄). A dashed gray line indicates typical ocean pH. (b) The distribution of inorganic carbon species as a function of the extent of realkalinization, showing the persistence of H₂CO₃* at low(er) pH, and HCO₃⁻ and CO₃²⁻ at high(er) pH. M–HCO₃⁻ and M–CO₃²⁻ represent aqueous HCO₃⁻ and CO₃²⁻ complexes with Na⁺, Ca²⁺, and Mg²⁺.

300

301 Olivine (Mg,Fe²⁺)₂SiO₄) is the most abundant mineral (ultramafic, and otherwise) in the 302 Earth's upper mantle. On the Earth's surface, olivine is primarily found in ophiolites, which are 303 sections of the uppermost mantle and oceanic crust that are exposed on land by tectonic 304 activity, and that are found worldwide along convergent and divergent plate boundaries. 305 Ophiolites are composed of a specific sequence of mafic (basalt, gabbro) and ultramafic

306 (peridotites such as harzburgite, dunite) rocks and can have thicknesses on the order of 5 to 10 307 km and encompass areas exceeding ~100,000 km².^{41,42} Peridotites are intrusive rocks that are

308	classified based on the amounts of olivine, clinopyroxene ((Ca,Na,Li)(Mg,Fe ²⁺ ,Al,Fe ³⁺)Si ₂ O ₆), and
309	orthopyroxene ((Mg,Fe)Si ₂ O ₆). In ophiolites, Iherzolite, harzburgite, and dunite peridotites are
310	most common, containing at least 40 mass % olivine. Assuming a thickness of 1 km, and an area
311	of 10,000 km ² , and 50 mass % fosteritic olivine (Mg ₂ SiO ₄), leads to a volume of 5,000 km ³ ,
312	substantially exceeding the volume of olivine needed to sequester all anthropogenic CO_2
313	emitted into the atmosphere, i.e., including ongoing (17 km ³ per year; ~36 Gt per year) and all
314	legacy emissions (1225 km ³ ; ~2500 Gt since 1850). ⁴³ In other words, if appropriately harvested,
315	natural mafic and ultramafic rocks and minerals are an effectively limitless supply of alkalinity
316	for CO ₂ management. Beyond such rocks, industrial processes produce ~7 Gt of alkaline solids
317	per year, including (but not restricted to) products and by-products such as lime (~430 Mt),
318	cement kiln dust (~478 Mt), slags (~516 Mt), and coal ash (~701 Mt). ^{44,45}

- 319
- Table 4. The diversity of alkaline solids that can be used for effluent alkalinization ordered as a
 function of their stoichiometric acid neutralization capacity (ANC).

Solute Description		ANC (mol
		H⁺/kg solid)
Periclase	MgO, a mineral found in metamorphic rocks	49.63
Lime	CaO, can be naturally occurring or synthetic	35.66
Lime kiln dust ⁴⁶	By-product of lime manufacturing	34.38
Forsterite	Mg ₂ SiO ₄ , the Mg-endmember of olivine	28.43
Olivine ⁴⁷	Group of nesosilicate minerals found in ultramafic rocks	25.97
Larnite	Ca ₂ SiO ₄ , a nesosilicate found in crystalline slags	23.22
Serpentinite	Ultramafic rock rich in serpentine, a hydrothermal alteration product of olivine	22.96
Basalt	Fine-grained mafic rock rich in plagioclase feldspar and pyroxene	22.91
Stainless steel slag	Semicrystalline by-product of metal manufacturing	22.02
Peridotite	Ultramafic rock rich in olivine with some pyroxene	22.00
Lizardite (Serpentine)	Mg ₃ (Si ₂ O ₅)(OH) ₄ , a phyllosilicate	21.65
Ladle slag	Semicrystalline by-product of metal manufacturing	20.40
Blast furnace slag ⁴⁸	Semicrystalline by-product of metal manufacturing	19.97
Diopside	CaMgSi ₂ O ₆ , a single-chained inosilicate (pyroxene)	18.47
Air-cooled blast furnace slag	Crystalline by-product of metal manufacturing	17.78
Wollastonite	CaSiO ₃ , a single-chained inosilicate	17.22
Basic oxygen furnace slag	Semicrystalline by-product of metal manufacturing	16.85
Brownmillerite	Ca ₂ (Al,Fe ³⁺) ₂ O ₅ , a non-stoichiometric perovskite	16.66
Comingled electric		
arc furnace	Semi-crystalline by-product of metal manufacturing	16.64
slag		

Cement kiln dust ⁴⁸	Amorphous by-product of Ordinary Portland Cement (OPC) production	15.94
Talc	Mg₃Si₄O10(OH)2, a phyllosilicate	15.82
Electric arc furnace slag	Semi-crystalline by-product of metal manufacturing	15.08
Class C fly ash	High-calcium fly ash from processing subbituminous and lignite coals	13.59
Reclaimed Class C fly ash	High-calcium fly ash reclaimed from landfill	13.45
Anorthite	CaAl ₂ Si ₂ O ₈ , Ca-endmember of plagioclase feldspar, a tectosilicate	9.61
Trona-rich fly ash	Fly ash containing Na ₃ (CO ₃)(HCO ₃)·2H ₂ O	9.44
Bytownite	Na _{0.2} Ca _{0.8} Al _{1.8} Si _{2.2} O ₈ , a type of plagioclase feldspar, a solid solution of NaAlSi ₃ O ₈ and CaAl ₂ Si ₂ O ₈	6.55
Gabbro	Coarse-grained mafic rock rich in plagioclase feldspar and pyroxene	6.48
Anorthosite	Fine-grained mafic rock rich in anorthite	5.65
Albite	NaAlSi ₃ O ₈ , Na-endmember of plagioclase feldspar, a tectosilicate	3.80
Class F fly ash	Low-calcium fly ash from processing anthracite and bituminous coals	1.91

323 The Goldich stability series indicates that the relative reactivity of silicate minerals is 324 dependent on their crystallization temperatures, i.e., minerals formed at higher temperatures 325 are more reactive than those formed at lower temperatures (Fig. 6a). This is further reflected in 326 the degree of polymerization of tetrahedral silicate units, i.e., in general, a higher Si to O ratio 327 signifies greater polymerization and lower temperature of cooling. For example, comparing the 328 reactivities of anorthite and forsterite, both abundant silicates that are reservoirs of Ca and Mg, 329 reveals that forsterite is more reactive owing to its structure in which all SiO₄^{4–} units are 330 connected to each other by Mg²⁺ ions.^{49,50} On the other hand, anorthite features a framework silicate structure with extensive sharing of O atoms by Si.⁵¹ In addition, kinetic considerations 331 332 such as the rates of water exchange around the cations also influence reactivity; for instance, 333 Ca-based silicates dissolve faster than Mg-based silicates despite having an equivalent 334 (crystallographic) structure due to the stronger solvation-state of Mg as compared to Ca.⁵² Using data from Pokrovsky and Schott (2000),⁴⁹ the rate of forsterite dissolution as a function of 335 336 pH for 1 < pH < 7 can be expressed as $R = 2.376 \times 10^{-11} e^{-1.15(pH)}$, where R is the dissolution rate 337 in mol/cm²/s (see Fig. 6a). Using this relation, the dissolution rates at pH 1, 2, 3, 4 can be estimated as 7.53 × 10⁻¹², 2.38 × 10⁻¹², 7.54 × 10⁻¹³, and 2.39 × 10⁻¹³ mol/cm²/s, respectively. For 338 339 a non-porous sphere, i.e., where the external surface area is all that is reactive, the specific 340 surface area (SSA) and particle diameter (d) are related by: $d = 6/(SSA \times \rho)$, where ρ is the 341 density (Fig. 6b). The effect of specific surface area on the mass-normalized dissolution rate can 342 be estimated to assess the fineness of particles and the residence time in a column reactor that 343 are required to achieve the rate and extent of mineral dissolution in the highly acidic anolyte 344 sufficient to ensure divalent cation abundance renewal, and therefore realkalization (Fig. 6c).

- 345 The rate equations can also be used to calculate time-dependent pH evolution during mineral
- 346 dissolution. For example, progressively dissolving 50 kg of forsterite (d_{50} = 10 µm) in 1000 kg of
- 347 water (initial pH = 1) results in the production of ~60 mol Mg^{2+} (60 mmol Mg^{2+}/kg) within 24 h.
- For comparison, ~80 mmol Mg^{2+}/kg is required to raise the pH of the analyte from ~1 to ~8.2 348
- 349 (i.e., native seawater pH) (Fig. 4a). Decreasing the particle size increases the dissolution rate, at
- 350 an energy expense. For instance, using a Bond Work Index approach, for silicate rocks, we
- 351 estimate a grinding energy of around 70 kJ per kg rock is needed to produce particles with $d_{50} \sim$
- 352 100 µm for dissolution. Significantly, the intense acidity (pH~1) of the anolyte effluent that is
- generated herein is useful in that it enables accelerated silicate dissolution. 353

Sur 10000

Specific

5000

0

1

10

(b)

d (µm)

100

354



5 10x10⁻¹

4.0x10

0.0

<u>is</u>

1000



<u>c</u> -14

စ္မ် -15

-16

-17

-18

0 2 4 6 8

diopside

anthophyllite talc

chrysotile

рΗ

(a)

10 12

14

ρH = 4

30000

pH = 3

20000

10000

(c)

Specific Surface Area (cm²/g)

Figure 6. (a) The dissolution rate of Ca and Mg silicates at 25 °C as a function of pH, following Schott et al. (2009).⁵⁰ (b) The dependence of the specific surface area on the diameter, assuming mono-sized spherics, and (c) The mass-normalized dissolution rate of forsterite as a function of the specific surface area for select anolyte pHs, calculated from (a) and (b).

356

357 Dissolution of brucite: A range of diverse processes including riverine input, atmospheric and 358 evaporite cycling, ion exchange, hydrothermal activity, low-temperature basalt weathering, and 359 carbonate deposition control the input-output balance of divalent seawater ions (Ca, Mg) and 360 the net change in seawater's alkalinity.⁵³ Natural processes result in a net flux for Ca that is zero (i.e., the amount added to the oceans is equal to the amount removed from the oceans by 361 carbonate deposition) and a net decrease in Mg concentration by 1.5×10^{12} mol per year.⁵³ 362 363 **Case 1** implies the dissolution of brucite in seawater, in which seawater is undersaturated with 364 respect to, raising its pH thereby drawing down atmospheric CO₂ thereby ensuring net CDR. The 365 dissolution of brucite progressively increases seawater's pH expanding its CO₂ storage capacity 366 (Fig. 7a) such that between 1.3-to-1.7 mol of CO_2 are absorbed per mol of $Mg(OH)_2$ (Fig. 7b).

367

368 Under static/batch conditions (i.e., $R_e \sim 0$, where R_e is the Reynolds number, unitless) 369 where there is very slow dissipation of dissolved species, locally, it is possible that increases in 370 the alkalinity of seawater, e.g., caused due to brucite dissolution, could result in alterations of 371 mineral saturation states. This could induce secondary carbonate formation (see Fig. 8) since 372 the increase in alkalinity shifts the $HCO_3^{-}-CO_3^{2-}$ distributions (e.g., see the Bjerrum diagram for 373 dissolved inorganic speciation) in seawater thereby facilitating aragonite precipitation via the combination of Ca^{2+} and CO_3^{2-} species. Thus, in circumstances wherein brucite-containing 374 375 effluent is discharged into the oceans it is necessary to examine how guickly: a) brucite may 376 dissolve?, and b) how quickly dissolved brucite species (i.e., particularly alkalinity) may be 377 dissipated? While the release of CO₂ that typically accompanies secondary carbonate 378 precipitation is not an issue (i.e., where the release of CO₂ occurs via bicarbonate rather than 379 carbonate combination with calcium species via the reaction: $Ca^{2+} + 2HCO_3^- \rightarrow CaCO_3 + CO_2 +$ 380 H₂O, such that 1 mol CO₂ is released per mol CaCO₃ precipitated)⁵⁴ in the presence of added 381 alkalinity (i.e., Mg(OH)₂ dissolution), this aspect should nevertheless be considered in further 382 detail because: a) CaCO₃ precipitation will consume OH⁻, decreasing the efficiency of CO₂ 383 absorption (Fig. 7b, 7d) since it is more efficient to stabilize atmospheric CO_2 as aqueous 384 species than within mineral carbonates, and b) it could change locally, and at short time scales 385 the [Ca/Mg] ratios in seawater. 386



carbon and pH, and **(b)** saturation indices of seawater with respect to aragonite and brucite. The molar effectiveness of $Mg(OH)_2$ addition for CO_2 removal for each 0.0002 *m* addition of $Mg(OH)_2$ is also shown. Similar plots for a case where aragonite precipitation occurs in excess of the original saturation index of seawater are shown in **(c)** and **(d)**.

387

388 At seawater pH, the dissolution rate of brucite is on the order of 10⁻⁸ mol/m²/s.⁵⁵ To 389 achieve CO₂ removal at the level of 10 Gt/year would require the dissolution of 8.3 Gt of 390 Mg(OH)₂ corresponding to the addition of 1.1×10^{-7} mol Mg(OH)₂/kg seawater. If brucite 391 dispersion is assumed to be averaged across the world's oceans, an unrealistic and impractical 392 assumption, changes in seawater pH and mineral saturation indices are irrelevant. For context, 393 the critical saturation ratio, Ω , for runaway aragonite precipitation is 5 (SI = 0.69).⁵⁶ Using a 394 model that considers ocean circulation, i.e., ECCO (Estimating the Circulation and Climate of the Ocean) LLC270 physical fields,⁵⁷ and constraints of $\Delta pH = 0.1$ and $\Delta \Omega_{aragonite} = 0.5$, regions within 395 396 300 km of the coast can accommodate 100s of megatons of atmospheric CO₂ removal.⁵⁸ This 397 shows that simple near-coastal alkalinity discharge, such as that proposed herein, can scale to 398 several Gt per year if spread over available coastlines.⁵⁸ 399



401 An important question related to the *Equatic*[™] process involves answering the question: "What is the best approach for $Mq(OH)_2$ dissolution and atmospheric CO_2 drawdown: 402 403 *i.e., in the open ocean, or within an (industrial) plant?"* Each approach has distinct benefits and 404 challenges. First, we can consider the case wherein brucite dissolution occurs following the 405 discharge of the calcite and brucite (particulate) containing effluent into the ocean ("in ocean" 406 approach). This requires two steps leading to CO_2 removal: Step A) brucite dissolution, and Step 407 B) CO₂ drawdown from the atmosphere. At high brucite undersaturations and moderate 408 convective conditions (for comparison, the turbulence in oceans varies by at least 8 orders of 409 magnitude with characteristic R_e reports of 70 and 4×10^8), ^{59–61} the dissolution of brucite is 410 rapid requiring on the order of a few to 10s of hours. On the other hand, the equilibration of air 411 and sea (i.e., gas-liquid CO₂ concentrations) occurs over weeks to months depending on the mixed layer depth and wind speed.⁶² Therefore, to achieve atmospheric CO₂ drawdown, 412 413 Mg(OH)₂ must not only fully dissolve but also the alkalinized seawater must remain in the 414 mixed layer during this period. This results in an uncertainty regarding the amount of time and 415 the extent of CO₂ absorbed required for carbon dioxide drawdown from the atmosphere. 416 417 Second, we can consider a process configuration wherein air is bubbled into the brucite-418 containing catholyte within a high surface-to-volume (s/v, m⁻¹), high mass transfer rate aeration 419 reactor, i.e., inside-the-battery limit ("ISBL" approach) of an industrial plant. While such 420 aeration requires bubbling ~2500 t of atmospheric air to derive ~1 t of CO₂ (assuming ~420 ppm 421 of CO₂ in air) the absorption of CO₂ into the catholyte that contains CaCO₃ and Mg(OH)₂ results 422 in progressive $Mg(OH)_2$ dissolution and the stabilization of atmospherically derived CO_2 in the 423 form of HCO_3^- and CO_3^{2-} species; while the CaCO₃ that is present remains stable and 424 unaffected. Careful analysis shows that herein all residual Ca²⁺ precipitates as CaCO₃, while the 425 dissolution of $Mg(OH)_2$ in the presence of CO_2 results in the precipitation of hydromagnesite

426 and nesquehonite according to their respective saturation states, since magnesite formation is

427 unachievable at DIC levels (carbonate ion activities) relevant to atmospheric CO₂ conditions

428 (see **Figure 9**). Once deployed into the ocean, the hydrated magnesium carbonates redissolve,

increasing alkalinity. This analysis generally matches our experimental observations; and as a
 result of progressive CO₂ dissolution and stabilization, the pH of the catholyte decreases from

431 ~12.1 to ~9.0, corresponding with the dissolution of brucite. While this "ISBL" approach

432 requires aeration that implies an energy demand it is desirable in that it eliminates the

- 433 uncertainty of CO₂ removal and allows "in plant" quantifications of both the rate and extent of
- CO₂ removal. The obvious disadvantage is that it implies moving large quantities of air which 434
- 435 enhances the overall energy need of the process.
- 436



Figure 9. The changes in (a) pH, (b) solid phase assemblage, and total dissolved CO₂ in the catholyte during reaction with CO_2 to achieve equilibrium p CO_2 equivalent to atmospheric conditions at 25 °C. These simulations show that the catholyte solids discharge include hydromagnesite and aragonite, in general agreement with our experiments.

437

438 EquaticTM's Measurement, Reporting and Verification (MRV) approach for CO₂ removal

439 The net extent of CDR (CO₂ removal) accomplished by the EquaticTM process must be 440 measurable, verifiable, reportable, additional, and durable (permanent). In addition, the 441 potential for leakage, harm, and co-benefits must be considered. Using the analysis presented 442 in the sections above and in alignment with a recent approach suggested by CarbonPlan,⁶³ we can unambiguously calculate the net extent of CO₂ removal effected by the *EquaticTM* process 443 444 as follows:

- 445
- 446 447

Total Carbon Removal co2e = Drawdown co2e - Emissions co2e

448 where, Emissions $_{CO2e}$ includes the total embodied CO_2 emissions from material and energy use 449 (e.g., the grid emissions factor of electricity, and the amount of energy embodied in the co-450 produced hydrogen assuming typical purification demands, and conversion efficiencies), and: 451 452

453

Drawdown _{CO2e} = Equatic _{Dissolved}, _{CO2e} + Equatic _{Solid}, _{CO2e} - Evasion from seawater

454

The CO₂ sequestered as dissolved HCO_3^- and CO_3^{2-} ions, and solid carbonates can be quantified 455 unambiguously by weighing the masses of Mg(OH)₂ and CaCO₃ produced, and multiplying these

456 masses by a *carbon removal factor*, as follows (in units of $g CO_2$ per m³ of water processed):

458	Equatic _{Dissolved, CO2e} (g CO ₂ /m ³ water) = mass % Mg(OH) ₂ × total mass of solids (g/m ³ water) × (1.7
459	mol CO ₂ /mol Mg(OH) ₂) × (44.01 g CO ₂ /mol CO ₂) × (1 mol Mg(OH) ₂ /58.3197 g
460	Mg(OH) ₂)

462

462	Equatic solid, CO2e (g CO2/m ³ water) = mass % CaCO ₃ × total mass of solids (g/m ³ water) × (1 mol
463	CO ₂ /mol CaCO ₃) × (44.01 g CO ₂ /mol CO ₂) × (1 mol CaCO ₃ /100.0869 g CaCO ₃)

464

465 The total mass of the solids can be directly measured by separating the solids from the 466 catholyte effluent stream, and the mass percentages of Mg(OH)₂ and CaCO₃ quantified – online, 467 and in real-time, using thermogravimetric analysis (TGA). The carbon removal factor for Equatic 468 $D_{\text{Dissolved, CO2e}}$ is affected by the extent of Mg(OH)₂ dissolution and the extent of CO₂ absorption 469 (into water) from air. The ISBL approach discussed above eliminates these uncertainties. The 470 evasion of CO₂ from seawater may result from secondary CaCO₃ precipitation or the mixing of 471 un-neutralized acid (anolyte), albeit only in the case of the "in ocean" approach, considerations 472 of which are addressed above. While there are uncertainties regarding increasing the dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC) content of the oceans, notably, the *Equatic*[™] approach counteracts 473 474 ocean acidification, which has been shown to significantly, favorably, influence marine life.⁶⁴

475 476 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

477 This paper presents a rigorous analysis of the *EquaticTM*: ocean-mediated process for 478 carbon dioxide removal (CDR). We examine two limiting pathways for CDR, one in which CO_2 is 479 trapped solely within calcium and magnesium carbonates, and another in which CO₂ is stored 480 both as solid carbonates and as aqueous HCO_3^- and CO_3^{2-} by means of ocean alkalinity 481 enhancement promoted by Mg(OH)₂ dissolution. We carefully examine how the anolyte and 482 catholyte effluents of the process present unique opportunities for rock dissolution and durable 483 and permanent CO_2 immobilization. We furthermore show how the process offers flexibility to 484 eliminate the uncertainties associated with quantifying the rate and extent of CDR and also 485 minimize any detrimental changes in seawater composition and chemistry from the influent to 486 the effluent. Furthermore, detailed considerations for realkalinization of the effluent including 487 acid neutralization capacity and reactivity of diverse mineral solutes were discussed. This 488 analysis provides the fundamental basis that justifies the viability of the approach and lays the 489 foundation of a quantitative approach for MRV of the EquaticTM process.

490

491 **Funding Sources**

492 The authors acknowledge financial support provided by: The Grantham Foundation for 493 the Protection of the Environment, the Chan Zuckerberg Initiative (CZI)/Chan Zuckerberg 494 Initiative Foundation (CZIF), the Public Utilities Board (PUB): Singapore's National Water 495 Agency, the Temasek Foundation, the National Science Foundation (NSF: Award # 2028462, and 496 CAREER Award # 2143159), the U.S. Department of Energy's Advanced Research Projects 497 Agency-Energy (ARPA-E: AMENDER: DE-AR0001551), and UCLA's Institute for Carbon 498 Management via the CAMELOT Technology Translation Initiative. The contents of this paper 499 reflect the views and opinions of the authors, who are responsible for the accuracy of the 500 datasets presented herein, and do not reflect the views and/or polices of the agency, nor do 501 the contents constitute a specification, standard or regulation. The authors acknowledge the

- 502 many individuals (too numerous to name individually) who have advised and assisted,
- 503 challenged and informed, and advanced our thinking as related to ocean-based carbon dioxide
- 504 removal, and the opportunities and challenges therein over the years.
- 505

506 **REFERENCES**

- 507 (1) National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. Negative Emissions
 508 Technologies and Reliable Sequestration: A Research Agenda, 2019.
- 509 (2) Kelemen, P. B.; McQueen, N.; Wilcox, J.; Renforth, P.; Dipple, G.; Vankeuren, A. P.
- 510 Engineered Carbon Mineralization in Ultramafic Rocks for CO₂ Removal from Air: Review 511 and New Insights. *Chem. Geol.* **2020**, *550*, 119628.
- 512 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemgeo.2020.119628.
- 513 (3) Matter, J. M.; Stute, M.; Snæbjörnsdottir, S. Ó.; Oelkers, E. H.; Gislason, S. R.; Aradottir, E.
 514 S.; Sigfusson, B.; Gunnarsson, I.; Sigurdardottir, H.; Gunnlaugsson, E.; Axelsson, G.;
- 515Alfredsson, H. A.; Wolff-Boenisch, D.; Mesfin, K.; Taya, D. F. de la R.; Hall, J.; Dideriksen, K.;516Broecker, W. S. Rapid Carbon Mineralization for Permanent Disposal of Anthropogenic
- 517 Carbon Dioxide Emissions. *Science* **2016**, *352* (6291), 1312–1314.
- 518 https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aad8132.
- (4) La Plante, E. C.; Mehdipour, I.; Shortt, I.; Yang, K.; Simonetti, D.; Bauchy, M.; Sant, G. N.
 520 Controls on CO2 Mineralization Using Natural and Industrial Alkaline Solids under Ambient
 521 Conditions. ACS Sustain. Chem. Eng. 2021, 9 (32), 10727–10739.
 522 https://doi.org/10.1021/acssuschemeng.1c00838.
- 523 (5) Veizer, J.; Hoefs, J.; Lowe, D. R.; Thurston, P. C. Geochemistry of Precambrian Carbonates:
 524 II. Archean Greenstone Belts and Archean Sea Water. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 1989, 53
 525 (4), 859–871. https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037(89)90031-8.
- 526 (6) Sundquist, E. T. Geological Perspectives on Carbon Dioxide and the Carbon Cycle. In *The* 527 *Carbon Cycle and Atmospheric CO₂: Natural Variations Archean to Present*; American
 528 Geophysical Union (AGU), 1985; pp 55–59. https://doi.org/10.1029/GM032p0005.
- (7) Renforth, P.; Henderson, G. Assessing Ocean Alkalinity for Carbon Sequestration. *Rev. Geophys.* 2017, *55* (3), 636–674. https://doi.org/10.1002/2016RG000533.
- Ken Caldeira; Makoto Akai. Ocean Storage. In *IPCC special report on carbon dioxide capture and storage*; Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005.
- (9) Watson, A. J.; Schuster, U.; Shutler, J. D.; Holding, T.; Ashton, I. G. C.; Landschützer, P.;
 Woolf, D. K.; Goddijn-Murphy, L. Revised Estimates of Ocean-Atmosphere CO₂ Flux Are
 Consistent with Ocean Carbon Inventory. *Nat. Commun.* 2020, *11* (1), 4422.
 https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-020-18203-3.
- (10) House, K. Z.; House, C. H.; Schrag, D. P.; Aziz, M. J. Electrochemical Acceleration of
 Chemical Weathering as an Energetically Feasible Approach to Mitigating Anthropogenic
 Climate Change. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 2007, *41* (24), 8464–8470.
 https://doi.org/10.1021/es0701816.
- 541 (11) Xie, H.; Liu, T.; Hou, Z.; Wang, Y.; Wang, J.; Tang, L.; Jiang, W.; He, Y. Using Electrochemical
- 542 Process to Mineralize CO₂ and Separate Ca²⁺/Mg²⁺ Ions from Hard Water to Produce High
- 543 Value-Added Carbonates. *Environ. Earth Sci.* **2015**, *73* (11), 6881–6890.
- 544 https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-015-4401-z.

- (12) Xie, H.; Liu, T.; Wang, Y.; Wu, Y.; Wang, F.; Tang, L.; Jiang, W.; Liang, B. Enhancement of
 Electricity Generation in CO₂ Mineralization Cell by Using Sodium Sulfate as the Reaction
 Medium. Appl. Energy 2017, 195, 991–999.
- 548 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apenergy.2017.03.072.
- (13) Sharifian, R.; M. Wagterveld, R.; A. Digdaya, I.; Xiang, C.; A. Vermaas, D. Electrochemical
 Carbon Dioxide Capture to Close the Carbon Cycle. *Energy Environ. Sci.* 2021, *14* (2), 781–
 814. https://doi.org/10.1039/D0EE03382K.
- (14) Sharifian, R.; Boer, L.; Wagterveld, R. M.; Vermaas, D. A. Oceanic Carbon Capture through
 Electrochemically Induced in Situ Carbonate Mineralization Using Bipolar Membrane.
 Chem. Eng. J. 2022, 438, 135326. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cej.2022.135326.
- (15) La Plante, E. C.; Simonetti, D. A.; Wang, J.; Al-Turki, A.; Chen, X.; Jassby, D.; Sant, G. N.
 Saline Water-Based Mineralization Pathway for Gigatonne-Scale CO₂ Management. ACS
 Sustain. Chem. Eng. 2021, 9 (3), 1073–1089.
- 558 https://doi.org/10.1021/acssuschemeng.0c08561.
- (16) Parkhurst, D. L.; Appelo, C. A. J. Description of Input and Examples for PHREEQC Version
 3—a Computer Program for Speciation, Batch-Reaction, One-Dimensional Transport, and
 Inverse Geochemical Calculations. US Geol. Surv. Tech. Methods Book 2013, 6, 497.
- 562 (17) Millero, F. J.; Feistel, R.; Wright, D. G.; McDougall, T. J. The Composition of Standard
 563 Seawater and the Definition of the Reference-Composition Salinity Scale. *Deep Sea Res.* 564 *Part Oceanogr. Res. Pap.* 2008, 55 (1), 50–72. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dsr.2007.10.001.
- 565 (18) NOAA US Department of Commerce. *Global Monitoring Laboratory Carbon Cycle* 566 *Greenhouse Gases*. https://gml.noaa.gov/ccgg/trends/mlo.html (accessed 2021-09-08).
- 567 (19) Dickson, A. G. An Exact Definition of Total Alkalinity and a Procedure for the Estimation of
 568 Alkalinity and Total Inorganic Carbon from Titration Data. *Deep Sea Res. Part Oceanogr.* 569 *Res. Pap.* **1981**, *28* (6), 609–623. https://doi.org/10.1016/0198-0149(81)90121-7.
- (20) Wolf-Gladrow, D. A.; Zeebe, R. E.; Klaas, C.; Körtzinger, A.; Dickson, A. G. Total Alkalinity:
 The Explicit Conservative Expression and Its Application to Biogeochemical Processes. *Mar. Chem.* 2007, *106* (1), 287–300. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marchem.2007.01.006.
- 573 (21) Middelburg, J. J.; Soetaert, K.; Hagens, M. Ocean Alkalinity, Buffering and Biogeochemical
 574 Processes. *Rev. Geophys.* 2020, *58* (3), e2019RG000681.
- 575 https://doi.org/10.1029/2019RG000681.
- (22) Zeebe, R. E.; Wolf-Gladrow, D. CO₂ in Seawater: Equilibrium, Kinetics, Isotopes, Third
 Impression 2005 (with corrections).; Elsevier Science: Amsterdam ; New York, 2001.
- Mook, W. G. Chapter 9: Chemistry of Carbonic Acid in Water. In *Environmental Isotopes in the Hydrological Cycle: Principles and Applications*; International Atomic Energy Agency,
 2001; Vol. 1, pp 87–98.
- 581 (24) Dickson, A. G. The Carbon Dioxide System in Seawater: Equilibrium Chemistry and
 582 Measurements. *Guide Best Pract. Ocean Acidif. Res. Data Report.* 2010, *1*, 17–40.
- 583 (25) Millero, F. J.; Roy, R. N. A Chemical Equilibrium Model for the Carbonate System in Natural
 584 Waters. *Croat. Chem. Acta* 1997, *70* (1), 1–38.
- 585 (26) Butler, J. N. *Ionic Equilibrium: Solubility and PH Calculations*; John Wiley & Sons, 1998.
- (27) Hain, M. P.; Sigman, D. M.; Higgins, J. A.; Haug, G. H. The Effects of Secular Calcium and
 Magnesium Concentration Changes on the Thermodynamics of Seawater Acid/Base
 Chemistry: Implications for Eocene and Cretaceous Ocean Carbon Chemistry and

- 589 Buffering. *Glob. Biogeochem. Cycles* **2015**, *29* (5), 517–533.
- 590 https://doi.org/10.1002/2014GB004986.
- (28) Hänchen, M.; Prigiobbe, V.; Baciocchi, R.; Mazzotti, M. Precipitation in the Mg-Carbonate
 System—Effects of Temperature and CO₂ Pressure. *Chem. Eng. Sci.* 2008, 63 (4), 1012–
 1028. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cog.2007.00.052
- 593 1028. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ces.2007.09.052.
- Shaojun, Z.; Mucci, A. Calcite Precipitation in Seawater Using a Constant Addition
 Technique: A New Overall Reaction Kinetic Expression. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 1993,
 57 (7), 1409–1417. https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037(93)90002-E.
- (30) Sabbides, T.; Giannimaras, E.; Koutsoukos, P. G. The Precipitation of Calcium Carbonate in
 Artificial Seawater at Sustained Supersaturation. *Environ. Technol.* **1992**, *13* (1), 73–80.
- (31) Lin, Y.-P.; Singer, P. C.; Aiken, G. R. Inhibition of Calcite Precipitation by Natural Organic
 Material: Kinetics, Mechanism, and Thermodynamics. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 2005, *39* (17),
 601 6420–6428. https://doi.org/10.1021/es050470z.
- (32) Zuddas, P.; Mucci, A. Kinetics of Calcite Precipitation from Seawater: II. The Influence of
 the Ionic Strength. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 1998, *62* (5), 757–766.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0016-7037(98)00026-X.
- 605 (33) Burton, E. A.; Walter, L. M. The Role of PH in Phosphate Inhibition of Calcite and Aragonite
 606 Precipitation Rates in Seawater. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **1990**, *54* (3), 797–808.
 607 https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037(90)90374-T.
- 608 (34) Bischoff, J. L. Catalysis, Inhibition, and the Calcite-Aragonite Problem; [Part] 2, The
 609 Vaterite-Aragonite Transformation. *Am. J. Sci.* **1968**, *266* (2), 80–90.
 610 https://doi.org/10.2475/ajs.266.2.80.
- (35) Mucci, A.; Canuel, R.; Zhong, S. The Solubility of Calcite and Aragonite in Sulfate-Free
 Seawater and the Seeded Growth Kinetics and Composition of the Precipitates at 25°C. *Chem. Geol.* 1989, 74 (3), 309–320. https://doi.org/10.1016/0009-2541(89)90040-5.
- (36) Cao, L.; Caldeira, K. Atmospheric Carbon Dioxide Removal: Long-Term Consequences and
 Commitment. *Environ. Res. Lett.* 2010, 5 (2), 024011. https://doi.org/10.1088/17489326/5/2/024011.
- (37) Cohen, A. L.; McCorkle, D. C.; de Putron, S.; Gaetani, G. A.; Rose, K. A. Morphological and
 Compositional Changes in the Skeletons of New Coral Recruits Reared in Acidified
 Seawater: Insights into the Biomineralization Response to Ocean Acidification. *Geochem. Geophys. Geosystems* 2009, *10* (7). https://doi.org/10.1029/2009GC002411.
- (38) Fabry, V. J.; Seibel, B. A.; Feely, R. A.; Orr, J. C. Impacts of Ocean Acidification on Marine
 Fauna and Ecosystem Processes. *ICES J. Mar. Sci.* 2008, 65 (3), 414–432.
 https://doi.org/10.1093/icesjms/fsn048.
- (39) Milazzo, M.; Rodolfo-Metalpa, R.; Chan, V. B. S.; Fine, M.; Alessi, C.; Thiyagarajan, V.; HallSpencer, J. M.; Chemello, R. Ocean Acidification Impairs Vermetid Reef Recruitment. *Sci. Rep.* 2014, 4 (1), 4189. https://doi.org/10.1038/srep04189.
- 627 (40) Segev, E.; Erez, J. Effect of Mg/Ca Ratio in Seawater on Shell Composition in Shallow
 628 Benthic Foraminifera. *Geochem. Geophys. Geosystems* 2006, 7 (2).
 629 https://doi.org/10.1029/2005GC000969.
- 630 (41) Dilek, Y. Ophiolite Concept and Its Evolution. *Geol. Soc. Am.* **2003**.
- 631 https://doi.org/10.1130/0-8137-2373-6.1.

- (42) Ali, M. Y.; Watts, A. B.; Searle, M. P.; Keats, B.; Pilia, S.; Ambrose, T. Geophysical Imaging of
 Ophiolite Structure in the United Arab Emirates. *Nat. Commun.* 2020, *11* (1), 2671.
- 634 https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-020-16521-0.
- (43) Schuiling, R. D.; De Boer, P. L. Coastal Spreading of Olivine to Control Atmospheric CO2
 Concentrations: A Critical Analysis of Viability. Comment: Nature and Laboratory Models
 Are Different. Int. J. Greenh. Gas Control 2010, 4 (5), 855.
- 638 (44) Statista. *Global production of lime 2021*. Statista.
- 639https://www.statista.com/statistics/1006040/production-of-lime-worldwide/ (accessed6402022-07-25).
- (45) Renforth, P. The Negative Emission Potential of Alkaline Materials. *Nat. Commun.* 2019, *10* (1), 1401. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-019-09475-5.
- (46) Latif, M. A.; Naganathan, S.; Razak, H. A.; Mustapha, K. N. Performance of Lime Kiln Dust as
 Cementitious Material. *Proceedia Eng.* 2015, *125*, 780–787.
- 645 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.proeng.2015.11.135.
- 646 (47) Ward's[®] Olivine (Fine). VWR. https://www.wardsci.com/store/product/8882507/ward-s 647 olivine-fine (accessed 2022-05-10).
- (48) Kalina, L.; Bílek, V.; Kiripolský, T.; Novotný, R.; Másilko, J. Cement Kiln By-Pass Dust: An
 Effective Alkaline Activator for Pozzolanic Materials. *Mater. Basel Switz.* 2018, *11* (9),
 E1770. https://doi.org/10.3390/ma11091770.
- (49) Pokrovsky, O. S.; Schott, J. Kinetics and Mechanism of Forsterite Dissolution at 25°C and
 PH from 1 to 12. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 2000, *64* (19), 3313–3325.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0016-7037(00)00434-8.
- (50) Schott, J.; Pokrovsky, O. S.; Oelkers, E. H. The Link Between Mineral
 Dissolution/Precipitation Kinetics and Solution Chemistry. *Rev. Mineral. Geochem.* 2009,
 70 (1), 207–258. https://doi.org/10.2138/rmg.2009.70.6.
- (51) Oelkers, E. H.; Schott, J. Experimental Study of Anorthite Dissolution and the Relative
 Mechanism of Feldspar Hydrolysis. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 1995, *59* (24), 5039–5053.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037(95)00326-6.
- 660 (52) Brantley, S. L. Kinetics of Mineral Dissolution. In *Kinetics of Water-Rock Interaction*;
 661 Brantley, S. L., Kubicki, J. D., White, A. F., Eds.; Springer New York: New York, NY, 2008; pp
- 662 151–210. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-0-387-73563-4 5.
- (53) McDuff, R. E.; Morel, F. M. M. The Geochemical Control of Seawater (Sillen Revisited).
 Environ. Sci. Technol. **1980**, *14* (10), 1182–1186. https://doi.org/10.1021/es60170a007.
- (54) Nguyen Dang, D.; Gascoin, S.; Zanibellato, A.; G. Da Silva, C.; Lemoine, M.; Riffault, B.;
 Sabot, R.; Jeannin, M.; Chateigner, D.; Gil, O. Role of Brucite Dissolution in Calcium
 Carbonate Precipitation from Artificial and Natural Seawaters. *Cryst. Growth Des.* 2017, 17
- 668 (4), 1502–1513. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.cgd.6b01305.
- (55) Pokrovsky, O. S.; Schott, J. Experimental Study of Brucite Dissolution and Precipitation in
 Aqueous Solutions: Surface Speciation and Chemical Affinity Control. *Geochim.*
- 671 *Cosmochim. Acta* **2004**, *68* (1), 31–45. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0016-7037(03)00238-2.
- (56) Moras, C. A.; Bach, L. T.; Cyronak, T.; Joannes-Boyau, R.; Schulz, K. G. Ocean Alkalinity
 Enhancement Avoiding Runaway CaCO₃ Precipitation during Quick and Hydrated Lime
 Dissolution. *Biogeosciences Discuss.* 2021, 1–31. https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2021-330.
- 675 (57) Zhang, H.; Menemenlis, D.; Fenty, I. ECCO LLC270 Ocean-Ice State Estimate. **2018**.

- 676 (58) He, J.; Tyka, M. D. Limits and CO_2 Equilibration of Near-Coast Alkalinity Enhancement. 677 EGUsphere Prepr. 2022, 1–26. https://doi.org/10.5194/egusphere-2022-683. 678 (59) Thorpe, S. A. An Introduction to Ocean Turbulence; Cambridge University Press: New York, 679 2007. 680 (60) Barkley, R. A. Johnston Atoll's Wake. J. Mar. Res. 1972, 30 (2), 201-216. 681 (61) Moum, J. N. Variations in Ocean Mixing from Seconds to Years. Annu Rev Mar Sci 2021, 13, 682 201–226. 683 (62) Jones, D. C.; Ito, T.; Takano, Y.; Hsu, W.-C. Spatial and Seasonal Variability of the Air-Sea 684 Equilibration Timescale of Carbon Dioxide. Glob. Biogeochem. Cycles 2014, 28 (11), 1163-685 1178. https://doi.org/10.1002/2014GB004813. 686 (63) Chay, F.; Klitzke, J.; Hausfather, Z.; Martin, K.; Freeman, J.; Cullenward, D. Verification 687 Confidence Levels for Carbon Dioxide Removal; CarbonPlan, 2022. 688 https://carbonplan.org/research/cdr-verification-explainer. 689 (64) Kroeker, K. J.; Kordas, R. L.; Crim, R.; Hendriks, I. E.; Ramajo, L.; Singh, G. S.; Duarte, C. M.; 690 Gattuso, J.-P. Impacts of Ocean Acidification on Marine Organisms: Quantifying 691 Sensitivities and Interaction with Warming. Glob. Change Biol. 2013, 19 (6), 1884–1896.
- 692 https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.12179.