Metamorphosis of activated nitrogen to ammonia at metal free ambient condition: A DFT based inquisition

Ratan Logdi, Arijit Bag, * and Ashwani K. Tiwari *

Activation of $N_2$ at an ambient condition and reduction to produce ammonia employing metal-free catalyst is one of the grand scientific problems to date. An effective appetite of carbenes towards molecular nitrogen proclaims their candidature as $N_2$ sequestering agent. However, the sequestering process is associated with a high activation energy barrier. Thus, to ameliorate the use of carbene for the $N_2$ activation process a Density Functional Theory (DFT) based design is pursued. Through a systematic study, the binding mechanism of the $C - N$ bond between carbene and nitrogen is explored to model efficient carbene. Additionally, Intrinsic Reaction Coordinate (IRC) geometry trapping followed by molecular orbital analysis was employed to explore the electronic level reaction mechanism of diazo derivative formation. It is corroborated that in the carbene $- N_2$ reaction, carbene operates as a $\sigma$-acceptor and $\pi$-donor where the bonding and the back bonding processes take place before and after the transition state of the reaction. With the aid of this knowledge, a model carbene is designed and computationally tested for nitrogen activation and ammonia formation. It is observed that the model carbene, $6CN$, is an efficient candidate for nitrogen activation and ammonia synthesis in a catalytic way. These results may stimulate future experimental inquisitions.

1 Introduction

Fixation of atmospheric nitrogen in the form of ammonia at an ambient condition in a green chemical pathway is one of the biggest challenges for chemical researchers. This is extremely important for the advancement of fertilizer industries and chemical technology. In nature, nitrogen fixation occurs primarily as ammonia by symbiotic and non-symbiotic microorganisms. Plants use this source of nitrogen for their growth. Thus, ammonia ($NH_3$) is a requisite chemical for fertilizer industries. It is also essential for dyes industries, explosive and resin production. For ammonia synthesis, industries still depend on the celebrated Haber-Bosch process which requires high temperature and pressure. Thus, modification of reaction conditions towards the ambient temperature and pressure will lead to a hugely energetic and economic profit for the respective industries and the society. In this respect, artificial nitrogen fixation is extremely important and considered a grand scientific problem as it will ease the ammonia synthesis from nitrogen and hydrogen.

Sequestering of atmospheric nitrogen by organometallic compounds was studied widely. Organometallic compounds are also useful to seize $N_2$ and to convert it to ammonia at an ambient condition to find out alternative chemical pathways. The $N_2$
fixation by the non-metallic process has also attracted attention very recently. In this new research avenue with the rapid development of carbene chemistry and its applications, carbenes are the front runners for the candidature of the $N_2$ sequestering agent.

The possibility of nitrogen fixation by carbene was first reported in 1964 by Moore et al. It is exhibited that methylene reacts with $N_2$ in matrix solution to form diazomethane. In an isotope labeling experiment of the photolysis reaction, it is observed that methylene is produced from the diazirine or diazomethane which again reproduces diazomethane by the reaction of newly generated methylene with the neighboring nitrogen. This outcome asserted that the sequestering of nitrogen using carbene is feasible which was further strengthened by Shilov et al. A similar kind of phenomenon was observed in the solution phase too.

The reaction between carbene and $N_2$ is well investigated with the help of quantum chemical tools. Liu et al. concluded from the experiments and theoretical studies that the thermal decomposition of diazirine compounds produces carbene and diazo compounds. The formations of the diazo derivatives and carbene compounds are controlled by the effect of the substituents of the diazirines. The $C_{60}$ probe was employed to confirm that carbene is produced in this reaction. It is affirmed that the rebound reaction of $N_2$ with carbene forms the diazo compounds.

Park et al. sketched a pathway to use carbene as a catalyst for $N_2$ activation by employing DFT and ab initio calculations. In this study, the binding aptitude of $N_2$ with different carbenes was tested. Computed results showed that the electron-donating tendency of the central carbene carbon governs the sequestering of $N_2$. The stability of the carbene – $N_2$ adduct is governed by the HOMO-LUMO energy gap of the carbene. Calculated results suggested that the cyclic diphenoxocarbene (PHC) is an affluent candidate for the fixation of $N_2$ and conversion of $N_2$ to $NH_3$. Another method is described by the same group where a carbene-based catalyst, bis-formyl-(PHCl) pyridine, is designed in such a fashion that two carbene moieties of this molecule are situated face to face and capable to bind $N_2$ from two opposite sides. This activated nitrogen is then converted to $NH_3$ by $Cp_2^*Cr$ as a reducing agent and $LuH^+$ as proton sources. The mechanistic details of this process were demonstrated and revealed that the highest activation energy barrier is 28.5 kcal/mol.

The recent development of the frustrated Lewis pair (FLP) chemistry for small molecule activation has also attracted several research groups to employ FLP to activate $N_2$. Carbene-boron is one such FLP that has been recognized as a significant candidate for sequestering of $N_2$. In 2019, Zhu et al. demonstrated an alternative $N_2$ fixation process by a newly designed carbene-boron FLP. In the case of $N_2$ fixation by carbene-boron FLP, one of the lone pairs of the $N_2$ is donated to the vacant $p$ orbital of the boron atom of the carbene-boron compound and another lone pair of the $N_2$ simultaneously attacks the electron-deficient carbene carbon of the carbene-boron compound. This reaction is thermodynamically and kinetically favorable. The same group has also developed another type of carbene-boron FLP which is more efficient than the previous one to activate $N_2$. This work is further extended by the same group which showed that for $N_2$ fixation by carbene-boron FLP, the substituents on the boron atom plays a major role.

Shahriar et al. proposed $N_2$ activation by employing persistent carbene pair. A similar kind of work on $SO_2$ fixation is reported recently by Logdi et al. In this method, a pair of the same carbenes, as well as different carbenes, are equally effective for sequestering and complete conversion of $SO_2$. From these two studies, it could be concluded that the use of persistent carbene pair may be more effective for small molecule activation and conversion. The mechanistic investigation of Shahriar et al. revealed that the reaction occurs through a diazoalkane intermediate.

In spite of considerable use of carbenes for $CO_2$ sequestering and conversion, they were unable to attract significant importance for the $SO_2$ fixation process due to the instability of carbene – $SO_2$ adduct. Very recently we reported that the modeling of proper carbenes, particularly, N-heterocyclic carbenes, is effective for the sequestering and conversion of $SO_2$.
to valuable chemicals.\textsuperscript{30–32} These carbenes are also highly reactive to NO\textsubscript{2}.\textsuperscript{31} The success of these studies motivates us to extend our studies with these carbenes for N\textsubscript{2} activation. Since carbene – SO\textsubscript{2} and carbene – NO\textsubscript{2} reactions are barrierless processes and occur at room temperature, carbene – N\textsubscript{2} reactions may occur at an ambient condition. We further extended our quest to convert the captured N\textsubscript{2} to ammonia.

To execute N\textsubscript{2} activation by carbene, initially four carbenes with seven substituents which are depicted in Figure 1, are tested. Carbene – N\textsubscript{2} reaction is exhibited in Figure 2. The energy profile diagrams of the nitrogen activation process for different carbenes are constructed. Gibb’s free energy values are used for this purpose. By the analysis of computed results, a model carbene is proposed which is used for further studies. The electronic mechanism of the nitrogen activation process by carbene is investigated using the IRC trapping method explained in our previous work.\textsuperscript{32}

2 Methodology

The geometry optimization of all the compounds is carried out by employing M06-2X\textsuperscript{30,31,44} functional adapting with 6-311++G** basis set for all of the atoms in Gaussian 09 package.\textsuperscript{45} Frequency calculations are carried out with the same level of theory to ensure that reactants, products and intermediates do not have any imaginary frequency and transition state has only one mode of imaginary frequency. The IRC calculations are executed to assure the transition states. The thermodynamic properties are calculated with the assistance of frequency calculations. All the calculations are furnished at 298 K temperature.

3 Results and Discussion

Four different types of carbenes (1\textsuperscript{R}, 2\textsuperscript{R}, 3\textsuperscript{R} and 4\textsuperscript{R}) are chosen for the present study which are presented in Figure 1. For all types of carbenes, seven substituents (R = CF\textsubscript{3}, CN, H, Me, OMe, Ph, tBu) are considered. The reaction of N\textsubscript{2} with these 28 carbenes is studied. The activation energies for these reactions are compared to find out the best carbene for N\textsubscript{2} activation. The orbital energies of carbenes and N\textsubscript{2} are analyzed to track down the electronic mechanism of nitrogen activation by carbene. How the substitutions at the nitrogen atom of the carbene frame affect the activation of the reaction is analyzed. On this basis carbene 5\textsuperscript{R} is modeled and continued for further investigation. The N\textsubscript{2} activation by carbene 5\textsuperscript{R} is found very good and better than all other carbenes considered earlier. Unfortunately, the Gibb’s free energy change for carbene 5\textsuperscript{R} – N\textsubscript{2} reaction is positive. Therefore, we extended our studies in two different avenues. First, we follow the use of persistent carbene\textsuperscript{15,32} to obtain a stable and thermodynamically favorable azo derivative. This technique is pursued due to the fact that the use of two carbenes for sequestering and conversation of SO\textsubscript{2} to valuable chemicals was proved effective.\textsuperscript{32} In the inquisition of efficient carbenes for N\textsubscript{2} activation, we also followed the substitution of the heteroatom of the carbene backbone. This methodology is accomplished owing to verifying the effect of substitution of the heteroatom nitrogen by phosphorus.

Both the aforementioned methods were found suc-
cessful to obtain the activated nitrogen as a stable product. However, the substitution of hetero-nitrogen by phosphorus is more prolific to yield stable derivatives with lower activation energy. Thus, we continued our quest to convert activated nitrogen to ammonia with phosphorus substituted carbene. Electronic level investigations are carried out to explore the electron transfer mechanism of different reactions involved in the nitrogen activation process and the understanding of the role of the hetero atom and the substitution at the heteroatom.

3.1 Comparison of nitrogen activation efficacy of selected carbenes

First, the reactions of selected carbenes with nitrogen are performed and analyzed. To explore the substitution effect, the energy profile diagrams of different substitutions of the same carbene backbone are plotted together.

3.1.1 carbene 1\(^R\)

Carbene 1\(^R\) (Figure 3, \(R = CF_3, CN, H, Me, OMe, Ph, tBu\)) reacts with \(N_2\) to form 1A\(^R\) which is in fact, a pre-complex formed due to the formation of weak hydrogen bonding between a nitrogen atom of \(N_2\) molecule and the nearest hydrogen atom of the carbene molecule. The hydrogen bonding distances of different pre-complexes are within 2.7 Å to 2.9 Å. This step is endergonic for all carbenes. In the very next step, 1A\(^R\) converts to 1B\(^R\) through a transition state TS1\(^R\). 1B\(^R\) is the activated complex that we are looking for. The energy required for the formation of TS1\(^R\) from 1A\(^R\) is the activation energy for this step. In Figure 3, it is observed that the lowest activation energy is 22.7 kcal/mol which is for the CN substitution and the highest activation energy is 30.1 kcal/mol which is for the OMe substitution. The change in the activation energy of the reaction follows the trend CN < CF\(_3\) < Ph < Me < H < tBu < OMe. However, for all carbenes, the free energy change for the formation of 1B\(^R\) from the starting materials is positive. The order of stability of 1B\(^R\) follows the trend CN > CF\(_3\) > Ph > Me > tBu > H > OMe that is likely correlated to corresponding activation energies.

3.1.2 carbene 2\(^R\)

The reaction between carbene 2\(^R\) (\(R = CF_3, CN, H, Me, OMe, Ph, tBu\)) and \(N_2\) is presented in Figure 4. Here, 2A\(^R\) is the pre-complex. The activation energies for the formation of 2B\(^R\) from 2A\(^R\) follow the trend CN < CF\(_3\) < Ph < tBu < H < Me < OMe which is very similar to the trend observed for carbene 1\(^R\) except for Me, tBu and H. The order of the stabilities of activated complexes shows a different trend; CN > CF\(_3\) > Ph > OMe > H > Me > tBu. The change in the order of stability may be due to the presence of the bridge at the carbene backbone. Here, the steric factor of tBu reduces its stability. Additionally, due to the steric hindrance, the observed activation energies are higher for all substitutions corresponding to their 1\(^R\) analogue. The highest and the lowest activation energies for these carbenes are 41.0 kcal/mol and 30.1 kcal/mol. The highest activation energy is for the OMe substituents and the lowest activation energy is for the CN substituents. Interestingly, for the 1\(^R\) carbene, these two substituents show the highest and the lowest activation energy respectively.

3.1.3 carbene 3\(^R\)

The effect of substitutions (\(R = CF_3, CN, H, Me, OMe, Ph, tBu\)) to carbene 3\(^R\) is very similar to the other two carbenes discussed so far. The energy profile diagrams of carbene 3\(^R\) − \(N_2\) reactions are presented in Figure 5. The nature of pre-complexes formed for different substitutions (3A\(^R\)) are resembling previous carbenes. There is no significant change in the qualitative nature of the energy profile diagram. The free energy
change for the formation of diazo derivative (carbene – N₂ adduct which is 3B⁺ in Figure 5) is positive for all substituents as observed for the earlier two carbones. There are few changes in the order of activation energies and stabilities of diazo derivatives of different substituents. It is observed that for this carbene, the activation energy for the CF₃ substituent is less than the CN substituent by 0.6 kcal/mol. However, the CN substituted diazo derivative is more stable than that of the CF₃ substituted diazo derivative by 2.5 kcal/mol. The lowest and highest activation energies for 3R carbene are 29.1 kcal/mol and 39.5 kcal/mol respectively corresponds to CF₃ and OMe substituents. The most stable diazo derivative is obtained for the CN substituent and the order of stability is CN > CF₃ > tBu > Ph > Me > H > OMe.

3.1.4 carbene 4R

The reaction of N₂ with 4R carbene is presented in Figure 6. The formation of diazo derivative follows the same reaction path that is the formation of pre-complex (4A⁺), transition state (TS4) and diazo derivative. These steps are endergonic for all substituents of this carbene. There is no significant change in the order of the activation energy barrier (CN < CF₃ < Ph < Me < H < tBu < OMe) and the order of stability (CN > CF₃ > Ph > OMe > H > Me > tBu). The lowest activation energy barrier is 30.5 Kcal/mol that is for 4CN and the highest activation energy barrier is 45.8 Kcal/mol (for 4OMe). For this carbene, CN substituent produces the most stable diazo derivative that is common for the other three carbones too.

3.2 Analysis of carbene – N₂ reactions

The carbene -N₂ reactions were studied for 28 selected carbones taking four different carbene backbones (1R, 2R, 3R and 4R) and seven different substituents (CF₃, CN, H, Me, OMe, Ph, tBu) are discussed in detail in the previous subsection. The observations are following:

- All diazo derivatives are thermodynamically unstable (ΔG > 0).
- The lowest activation energy is observed for 1CN carbene.
- The activation energy and the thermodynamic stability of the diazo derivative depend on the chemical nature of the substitution at the heteroatom.
- In most cases, the activation energy is the least and the stability of the diazo derivative is the
highest for carbene $1^R$ of a particular substituent. This is true for almost all substituents.

Since the carbenes that are studied so far are associated with positive free energy change, these reactions are thermodynamically restricted. These reactions are only helpful to activate the $N_2$ molecule. Henceforth, these reactions should be coupled with other reactions to make a complete process thermodynamically feasible. In various ways, this could be achieved. The activated nitrogen may be converted to ammonia or other useable compounds that are associated with considerable negative free energy change. There is another way to stabilize the unstable diazo derivative. Selected chemicals may be employed that will play down the free energy of the reaction. The modeling of carbene may also lead to the thermodynamically acceptable production of diazo derivatives. These three approaches are followed in the present study.

To select an appropriate chemical to abate the reaction-free energy, the binding nature of the diazo derivative should be investigated. The effect of substitution to the carbene moiety is also analyzed to model carbenes that would be competent to produce diazo derivatives are associated with a negative free energy change.

3.2.1 Effect of substitution

It is observed that the most stable diazo derivatives are produced for $CN$ substituent of all four carbenes under study. The same is true for the activation energy of this process too, except for carbene $3^R$ where the activation energy of the $CF_3$ substituent is lower by only 0.6 kcal/mol than the $CN$ substituent. Thus, the energy profile diagram for the $CN$ substituents of four different carbenes are compared and presented in Figure 7. It is accomplished from figure 7 that the $1^{CN}$ carbene is the most fruitful considering both the factors (the activation energy and the stability of the diazo compound).

Therefore, we investigate why $1^{CN}$ carbene is the affluent candidate for $N_2$ activation among all carbenes studied so far. From the structure of carbene $1^R$ presented in Figure 1, it is perceived that the carbene $1^R$ contains one $C = O$ group which is absent from the structure of the rest of the carbenes. The impact of the $C = O$ group on this process is yet to be brought to light. To cast more light on this matter, the molecular and electronic level inquisition is explored. The binding nature of carbene and $N_2$ is examined and the flow of electrons during this reaction is captured. The dominance of different substituents on the reactivity of carbene with nitrogen is also reviewed.

3.2.2 Binding nature

It is well known that carbene may act as a $\sigma$-donor and $\pi$-acceptor. It may also act as a $\pi$-acceptor only. The exact role of the carbene depends on the nature of its counter reactant. It also depends on the structure of the carbene too. It is because the ground state of the small carbene is a triplet in nature whereas N-heterocyclic carbenes have a singlet ground state. There are two different possibilities of ground-state electronic distribution of singlet carbenes—the electron pair may occupy the $\sigma$ orbital or the $\pi$ orbital. The carbenes considered for this study, have the $\sigma$ ground state. The frontier molecular orbitals of the ground state of $1^H$ carbene are presented in Figure 8. Depending upon the availability of the electron pair of the carbene and the electrophilicity difference between carbene and other reacting molecules, bonding and back bonding takes place. It is reported that the reaction of $SO_2$ with NHC occurs through the $\sigma$ electron ($\sigma^2$) donation of NHC to the $\pi^{*(0)}$ of $SO_2$. The reaction of NHC with $NO_2$ also occurs through $\sigma$ electron ($\sigma^2$) donation of NHC. However, for this reaction, the $NO_2$ molecule is electronically excited to
create a vacant \( \sigma \) orbital ( \( \sigma^1 \sigma^* \rightarrow \sigma^0 \sigma^* \)).

The electronic configuration of the frontier molecular orbital of \( N_2 \) is \( 1\pi_g^4 3\sigma_g^2 1\pi_u^0 3\sigma_u^0 \). The electronic probability distributions of these orbitals are presented in Figure 9. Thus, it is expected that the interaction between NHC and \( N_2 \) would be the same as it is observed for carbene \(- SO_2 \) reaction. Park et al. come to a similar conclusion through a DFT study, while Grieve et al. experienced a different conclusion. They observed that carbenes containing vacant \( \sigma \) orbital and filled \( \pi \) orbital (\( \sigma^0 \pi^2 \) configuration) have better appetite towards \( N_2 \) and the electrophilicity of the carbenes governs the reaction. Since the singlet state of the carbene preferred the reaction and \( \sigma^0 \pi^2 \) configuration has better activity, it could be concluded that \( 3\sigma_g^2 \) electron of \( N_2 \) is donated to the carbene first. It is exactly the reverse of the conclusion drawn by Park et al. However, this is explainable. Though the nitrogen atom is highly electronegative, accepting an electron pair from carbene at a \( \pi^* \) orbital of a small molecule like \( N_2 \) with a triple bond, is improbable. Henceforth, the electronic mechanism of the carbene \(- N_2 \) reaction is investigated.

To explicit the carbene \(- N_2 \) reaction, the orbital energies of the frontier molecular orbitals of carbene (\( 1H \)) and \( N_2 \) molecule are compared and presented in Figure 10. In Figure 10, it is observed that the lowest energy vacant \( \pi^* \) orbital of \( N_2 \) has positive orbital energy. Thus, the donation of \( \sigma \) electron pair of carbene to this orbital would be difficult. Energies required for different electronic transitions are given in Figure 10. The minimum energy required for the brown path is 7.87 eV which is significantly higher than the green path. The minimum energy required for the green path is 6.48 eV. Thus, the \( \sigma \) donation and \( \pi \) acceptance behavior of carbene are not observed here (brown path). This reaction follows the green path. In the green path, the HOMO electron pair of carbene is excited to the LUMO which is followed by the HOMO electron donation of \( N_2 \). The complex is further stabilized by the back donation of electrons from carbene to the vacant \( \pi^* \) orbital of \( N_2 \). This is confirmed by the charge distribution of the diazo derivative where the central nitrogen is positively charged.

The change in the HOMO electron cloud of the diazo derivative formation along the reaction path is depicted in Figure 11. It is observed that at first the \( \sigma \) electron cloud of \( N_2 \) started to elongate towards carbene carbon (IG2) when two reactants get closer. The orbital overlap between carbene carbon and \( N_2 \) is observed at the initial stage of the reaction (IG3). Along the reactant path, the extent of the orbital overlap is enhanced with the advancement of the reaction till the transition state is attained. There is no significant change in this orbital overlap along the product path. The formation of the back bonding started after crossing the transition state. The back bonding is predominantly governed by the elongation of the HOMO electron cloud over the carbene carbon (IG8) towards the \( \pi \) orbital of nitrogen. The overlap is almost completed at IG10 which is very close to the product. From these observations, it may be concluded that this reaction occurs through the \( \sigma \) electron donation of nitrogen and back donation of carbene.
3.2.3 Modelling of new carbene

Among all carbenes studied so far, $1^{CN}$ carbene is found the most effective for $N_2$ activation which is due to the presence of the $C=O$ group. Thus, a carbene is modeled by adding one more $C=O$ group to $1^{CN}$ carbene which is presented in Figure 12. Nitrogen activation reaction is studied with this carbene. The effect of substitution is also studied. The energy profile diagram for the activation reaction with this carbene ($5^R$) is presented in Figure 13.

The reaction between $N_2$ and carbene $5^R$ (Figure 13) follows similar trends as it is observed for four other carbenes. First, the pre-complex $5A^R$ is formed through an endergonic process. The very next step is the transformation of $5A^R$ to $5B^R$ through a transition state $TSS^R$. The effect of substitution is almost the same for this carbene too. The activation energy barrier for different substituents obeys the order $CN < CF_3 < H < Me < OMe < tBu$. The lowest and the highest activation energy barrier for this step is 20.8 Kcal/mol and 27.4 Kcal/mol for $5^{CN}$ and $5^{tBu}$ respectively. This is very interesting because the highest activation energy is only 27.4 kcal/mol which implies that these carbenes are able to activate $N_2$ at room temperature. This result is also inspiring because the change in the carbene frame through the addition of one $C=O$ group is found effective for lowering the activation energy. The high activity of carbene due to the presence of the $C=O$ group in the carbene frame and the $CN$ functional group connected to the heteroatom of the carbene frame support our conclusion regarding the binding nature discussed earlier.

Unfortunately, the free energy change of this process is still positive for all of the substituents. The stability order of the diazo derivative is $CN > CF_3 > Ph > Me > H > tBu > OMe$. The most stable diazo
Fig. 11 Change of HOMO electron cloud along IRC
derivative is for the $5^{CN}$ (free energy change is 13.5 kcal/mol). At present, there is no clue to find a better carbene that would be effective for $N_2$ activation at room temperature and produce a thermodynamically stable diazo derivative. Thus, alternative techniques are explored to reach our goal.

3.3 Stabilization of activated $N_2$

Our propensity is to activate the $N_2$ by carbene at an ambient condition and stabilize the diazo derivatives. This is achieved in three different ways – reducing the diazo derivative by hydrogen, through the formation of azo derivative, and employing mutation of the heteroatom of N-heterocyclic carbene.

3.3.1 Reduction of diazo compound by $H_2$ molecule

To stabilize the diazo derivative of the model carbene, $5B^{CN}$, reduction of this derivative by hydrogen is studied. The result is presented in Figure 14. This study is performed because our prime goal is to convert molecular nitrogen and hydrogen to ammonia. Enthusiastically it is observed that the reaction-free energy for this step (-22.6 kcal/mol) and the total process as well is negative (-9.5 kcal/mol). Thus, thermodynamically this process is feasible. However, the activation energy for the reduction of the diazo derivative is quite high (59.5 kcal/mol) which indicates that this reaction may occur at a higher temperature.

3.3.2 Stabilization of activated $N_2$ through the formation of azo derivative

It is reported that the reaction of two molecules of carbene with $SO_2$ is fruitful to convert the captured $SO_2$ to valuable chemicals. This approach is exercised for the present study. The schematic representation of this reaction is shown in Figure 15. The cyanide substituted model carbene ($5^{CN}$) is employed for this purpose. For this study, the second carbene is allowed to react with the diazo derivative ($5B^{CN}$). The complete (including the formation of the diazo derivative) energy profile diagram of this reaction is presented in Figure 16.
The reaction of the second carbene with the diazo derivative is exactly the same as it is observed for the reaction between the carbene and \( N_2 \). At first a pre-complex \( (5C^{CN}) \) is formed which is converted to the azo derivative \( (5D^{CN}) \) through a transition state \( TS'5^{CN} \). The only difference which is observed in the reaction of the second carbene molecule with the diazo derivative is the lowering of the activation energy and the stabilization of the product.

The energy required for the formation of the pre-complex \( (5C^{CN}) \) is 4.9 kcal/mol and for the transition state is 5.7 kcal/mol. This implies that the reaction of the second carbene molecule is more facile than the first one. It is also observed that the azo derivative is highly stable. The Gibbs’ free energy change of the total process is \(-54.8\) kcal/mol. Thus, we may conclude that in the presence of a high concentration of carbene, the formation of the azo derivative will be predominant over the diazo derivative.

### 3.3.3 Stabilization of activated nitrogen through the Mutation of the hetero atom (N-heterocyclic carbene \( \rightarrow \) P-heterocyclic carbene)

It is found that \( 5^{CN} \) carbene is highly effective to activate nitrogen. However, Gibbs’ free energy change for the formation of the diazo derivative is positive. Though the reaction of the second carbene molecule is effective to convert the diazo derivative to a highly stable azo derivative (free energy change is \(-54.8\) kcal/mol) further investigation is carried forward by mutating the heteroatom of carbene to obtain a thermodynamically stable diazo derivative. For this study, the hetero nitrogen of \( 5^{CN} \) carbene is substituted by phosphorus to have another model carbene \( (6^{CN}) \) presented in Figure 17. Phosphorus is chosen for this purpose as it is the same group element (below nitrogen) and it is also a trivalent atom.

A comparison between the energy profile diagrams of the reactions of \( 5^{CN} \) and \( 6^{CN} \) carbones with nitrogen is presented in Figure 18. It is observed that the reaction of P-heterocyclic carbene (PHC) with nitrogen is very similar to N-heterocyclic carbene. The reaction occurs through the formation of the pre-complex, transition state and diazo derivative. There is no significant change in the energy required for the formation of the pre-complex \( (6A^{CN}) \). However, an enthusiastic change in activation energy is observed. The required activation energy for the formation of the transition state \( (TS6^{CN}) \) is only 11.6 kcal/mol which is lower by 9.2 kcal/mol compared to its nitrogen analog. Thus, PHC is highly reactive to nitrogen even under ambient conditions. Not only that, the diazo derivative of PHC \( (6B^{CN}) \) is thermodynamically stable too. The Gibbs’ free energy change for this process is \(-10.1\) kcal/mol. From this study, it may be concluded that a proper mutation at the heteroatom may reduce the activation energy of the reaction and at the same time, it may increase the stability of the product.

### 3.4 Conversion of diazo compound to ammonia

So far, our study was limited to the activation of nitrogen and stabilization of the diazo derivative. It is observed that the model carbene \( (6^{CN}) \) is an efficient candidate for the sequestering of nitrogen at an ambient condition to yield a stable diazo derivative. Thus, the reduction of the diazo derivative is studied further. This reduction process is carried out with a fictitious reducing agent. For the computation process, only the \( H^+ \) ion and \( e^- \) are considered. The schematic reaction...
is presented in Equation 1.

\[ 6B^{CN} + 6H^+ + 6e^- \rightarrow 6^{CN} + 2NH_3 \]  

(1)

The catalytic cycle and energy profile diagram for the formation of ammonia by employing \( 6^{CN} \) carbene as a catalyst, is depicted in Figure 19 and Figure 20 respectively.

\( 6B^{CN} \) is converted to \( 6^{CN} \) and two molecules of ammonia through a series of successive reductions to complete the catalytic circle. In this study, \( H \) (as hydrogen atom) is added in each step. It is observed that all \( H \) addition are barrier-less processes and exergonic. Here, all steps of the reduction process are barrier-less due to the fact that only the addition of a hydrogen atom is considered. However, depending upon the nature of the hydrogen carrier or the reducing agent, there may exist an activation energy barrier for one or more steps. Though, the reduction process will remain exergonic. Thus, by employing an efficient reducing agent, the conversation of \( 6B^{CN} \) to \( 6^{CN} \) and \( NH_3 \) would be highly possible.

The addition of hydrogen occurs first at the terminal nitrogen. Till one molecule of ammonia is released, the addition of hydrogen occurs to the terminal nitrogen. After the release of one molecule of ammonia, the addition of hydrogen atoms occurs to the second nitrogen atom one by one until the second molecule of ammonia is released. Here, the reaction may occur through the ionization of a hydrogen atom to yield \( H^+ \) and electron (e). In the diazo derivative, the central nitrogen atom is positively charged. Thus, it attracts the electron of the hydrogen atom to form \( H^+ \) which is attracted by the terminal nitrogen. Thus, the addition of a hydrogen atom takes place at the terminal nitrogen atom.

3.5 Summary of the results

In the present inquisition, the reaction of \( N_2 \) with four principal carbenes\( (1^R, 2^R, 3^R, 4^R) \) with seven substituents \( (R = CF_3, CN, H, Me, OMe, Ph, tBu) \) are studied (Sec. 3.1). It is observed that among 28 carbenes \( 1^{CN} \) is the better candidate for \( N_2 \) sequestering. But the Gibbs’ free energy of reaction of the diazo derivative of all carbenes including \( 1^{CN} \) is positive. Therefore, the further quest was continued. A set of new carbenes \( (5^R, R = CF_3, CN, H, Me, OMe, Ph, tBu) \) analogous to carbene \( 1^R \), are also exploited for the fixation of nitrogen (Sec. 3.2). It is noticed that \( 5^{CN} \) is an affluent candidate for \( N_2 \) activation. However, the Gibbs’ free energy change for the formation of \( 5B^{CN} \) remains positive. Thus, further explorations were demanded which were fulfilled by the reduction of di-
azo derivative by hydrogen, formation of azo derivative and mutation at the heteroatom of the carbene (Sec. 3.3). The stabilization of the diazo derivative is attempted by the addition of molecular hydrogen. Though the initial aim was fulfilled, the activation energy of this process is very high. For the formation of the azo derivative, carbene ($5^\text{CN}$) was added to the diazo derivative ($5^B\text{CN}$). Through this process a stable azo derivative ($5^D\text{CN}$) was formed having -54.8 kcal/mol reaction free energy.

For the mutation of heteroatom of N-heterocyclic carbene, the nitrogen atom is replaced by the phosphorous atom of $5^\text{CN}$ carbene. This carbene is termed as $6^\text{CN}$ carbene. The reaction of $N_2$ with $6^\text{CN}$ was also studied. It is observed that activation energy and reaction-free energy of this reaction are 11.6 kcal/mol and -10.1 kcal/mol respectively. Among all carbenes, the lowest activation energy for the formation of the diazo derivative is observed for the $6^\text{CN}$ carbene. This diazo derivative is the most stable too. Therefore, $6^\text{CN}$ is the best candidate for $N_2$ activation in our present Inquisition.

An explicit discussion about the bonding nature and the binding process of the carbene – $N_2$ reaction is represented in Sec 3.2. It is observed that the diazo derivative is formed through the bonding – back-bonding phenomena of carbene. The HOMO of carbene has the $\sigma$ type symmetry and the LUMO of carbene has the $\pi$ type symmetry, and at the same time, the HOMO of $N_2$ is a $\sigma$ type orbital and the LUMO of $N_2$ is a $\pi$ type orbital. Thus, the electron donation of carbene to nitrogen is not possible in a straightforward way. The electron transfer and bond formation may occur through a complex pathway. The analysis of the molecular orbitals unveils that at first, the HOMO electron pair of carbene excited to the LUMO of carbene then the HOMO electron pair of $N_2$ is donated to the vacant HOMO of the carbene. In this process, the bonding is taken place. It is observed that the bonding process is completed before the transition state is reached. After crossing the transition state, the back-bonding takes place. The excited electron pair of carbene is donated to the vacant $\pi^*$ of $N_2$ to accomplish the back-bonding.

The possible conversion of the diazo derivative to ammonia is also studied and presented in Sec. 3.4. It is observed that $6^\text{CN}$ may act as a catalyst for the metamorphosis of $N_2$ to ammonia.

4 Conclusions

From the present study, it is concluded that by employing an appropriate carbene ($6^\text{CN}$ in this study) molecular nitrogen may be sequestered and converted to ammonia by the successive reduction process. Carbene acts as a $\sigma$-acceptor and $\pi$-donor in this process. The electronic level investigation proclaimed that the bonding and the back-bonding processes are not instantaneous. These two processes occur at different stages of the reaction. The bonding takes place before reaching the transition state while the back bonding occurs after the transition state which implies that these two processes are independent of each other.

Data availability

The optimized geometries of all compounds are available in the electronic supporting information file.

Conflicts of interest

The authors declare no competing financial interest.

Acknowledgements

R.L. acknowledges CSIR (CSIR file No. 09/921(0144)/2016-EMR-I), India for the financial support. A.B. and A.K.T. acknowledge IISER Kolkata, project No. IISER-K/DoRD/R&P/2017-18/295 for the financial support.

Notes and references

21 M. Soleilhavoup and G. Bertrand, Accounts of Chemical Research, 2015, 48, 256–266.
962–998.


